Table of contents

Acronyms and abbreviations

AMI	African Media Initiative
APC	Association for Progressive Communications
CBO	Community-based organisation
CMAP	Community Monitoring and Advocacy Project
COGTA	Department of Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs
COSATU	Congress of South African Trade Unions
CPSI	Centre for Public Service Innovation
CWP	Community Works Programme
DFID	Department for International Development
DPME	Department for Performance Monitoring and Evaluation
GGLN	Good Governance Learning Network
GIZ	Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit
GPRS	General packet radio service
HIVOS	Humanistisch Instituut voor Ontwikkelingssamenwerking
HSRC	Human Sciences Research Council
IBP	International Budget Partnership
ICASA	Independent Communications Authority of South Africa
ICT	Information and communication technology
IDP	Integrated development plan
MAVC	Making All Voices Count
NGO	Non-governmental organisation
NHI	National Health Insurance
NU	Ndifuna Ukwazi
ODAC	Open Democracy Advice Centre
ODADI	Open Data and Democracy Initiative
OUTA	Opposition to Urban Tolling Alliance
PAIA	Promotion of Access to Information Act
PEPFAR	President's Emergency Fund for AIDS Relief
PMG	Parliamentary Monitoring Group

R2K	Right2Know
SADA	South African Data Archive
SAHA	South African History Archive
SAHRC	South African Human Rights Commission
SALGA	South African Local Government Association
SARS	South African Revenue Service
SASSA	South African Social Security Agency
SIDA	Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency
SJC	Social Justice Coalition
SJC	Social Justice Coalition
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
USSD	Unstructured supplementary service data

Introduction

Background

Making All Voices Count (MAVC) is a global fund that supports innovation, scaling-up, and research to deepen existing innovations and help harness new technologies to enable citizen engagement and government responsiveness. MAVC is implemented by a consortium consisting of the Humanistisch Instituut voor Ontwikkelingssamenwerking (HIVOS), which is the lead organisation); the Institute of Development Studies and Ushahidi. MAVC is funded by the US Agency for International Development (USAID), the Department for International Development (DFID), Omidyar Network, and the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency (SIDA).

MAVC was developed to help address the large gap between citizens and the state. New technology has potential for improving governments' responsiveness and engagement with citizens. The MAVC partnership therefore will seek inclusive ways to empower all citizens to voice their concerns and demands, and to improve governments' responsiveness and accountability to those citizens. (While the title of the initiative includes the word "citizens", HIVOS confirmed that the scope extended to non-citizens, including groups such as refugees and migrant workers and their families.)

South Africa is one of the first set of countries in which MAVC will be implemented. This paper reports the findings of a country analysis which aimed to come up with strategic options for programming for MAVC in South Africa. The task involved two main activities:
- Identifying and mapping stakeholders, [government] champions, programmes and resources in the country in the field of citizen engagement, government responsiveness, research and technology.
- Carrying out an analysis of primary challenges and opportunities in advancing citizen engagement and government responsiveness

The focus was on the use of Internet and mobiles, but HIVOS indicated that there was also interest in particularly innovative use of other technologies such as video, television and radio.

Method used

HIVOS provided an Excel spreadsheet giving some suggested names and contact details of individuals, organisations and institutions. These ideas were used as the basis for the first contacts, with these contacts and others used for identifying further initiatives that might fit within the MAVC focus. In total, the exercise involved close on fifty telephonic, skype or face-to-face interviews, contact with many further people who provided information through email, and extensive use of Internet searches. The research was conducted within the space of a single month. This limited what could be done, and almost certainly means that there are some errors in the report.

A complicating factor was that MAVC had put out a global call for proposals for which the closing date fell within the month of November 2013 during which the research for the country analysis was undertaken. In discussion with HIVOS it was agreed that the two exercises – the call and the country analysis – would be treated as separate exercises. In practice this meant that the country analysis did not consider proposal documents. Further, informants were asked to provide information primarily about initiatives that were already in process or plans that would go ahead regardless of whether or not funding was obtained from MAVC. In practice, many of those interviewed and contacted had responded to the call for proposals and there is thus inevitably some overlap.

The structure of the remainder of this document largely follows the terms of reference in discussing:
- The legal and policy framework
- Non-governmental stakeholders
- Innovating information and communication technology (ICT) initatives
- Relevant research
- Government initiatives and approaches that engage citizens.

As discussed below, some of the initiatives uncovered by the research spanned more than one of these categories.

The final section of the report reflects on what was found through the research and offers some recommendations for MAVC in South Africa to consider going forward.

Legal and policy framework

This section of the report sketches the current legal and policy framework in South Africa so as to identify the barriers preventing and opportunities supporting the successful adoption and scaling up of citizen engagement initiatives in the country. Given the short time-frame available for the exercise as a whole, it was agreed that these issues should not be investigated in depth but that this section of the report should instead point to other sources of information on these topics.

The terms of reference suggested that this section of the report would also identify government champions. However, this discussion seemed more appropriate for the later section which discusses government initiatives.

A background document provided by HIVOS provided preliminary scores of green (ideal situation), yellow (average situation that needs improvement) and red (failing situation) in respect of the first set of countries targeted by MAVC. South Africa's scores are recorded as follows:
- Community-connectedness: Green
- Tech hub vibrancy: Green
- Women in tech groups: Yellow
- Tech events: Green
- Startup strength: Green

- Open data initiative: Red
- State of communication: Green
- ICT policy: Green
- Media: Yellow
- Track record: Yellow
- Education: Green

Unfortunately no narrative was available to expand on these scores.

Overall the ratings suggest a positive picture. However, several of the scores could be questioned, as follows:

- If community-connectedness is a measure of the extent of organisation within civil society, then green could be appropriate as South Africa has a wealth of organisations of many different types. Expressed differently, there is a vibrant civil society although one in which non-governmental organisations (NGOs) are facing a funding crisis probably more severe than ever faced before. If community-connectedness is intended as a measure of government "connections" to civil society, green is an over-optimistic assessment.

- On women in tech groups, the yellow may be over-pessimistic as the Higher Education Management Information System indicates that women accounted for 57% of overall enrolments at tertiary level in 2011 and 51% of enrolments in universities of technology. If this aspect is included because of a concern about inclusion, a more serious concern might relate to race as the apartheid legacy in respect of education is more severe in respect of race than in respect of gender.

- On open data, red seems over-pessimistic as government data of various kinds are probably more available in South Africa than in many other developing countries. Indeed, in some areas there is so much data that many users are overwhelmed. Also, the data may not always be available in machine-friendly form. Organisations and individuals – including political parties – who request data or information are also not always successful in having their requests met. Thus Right2Know's 2013 Secret State of the Nation report found that only 32% of Promotion of Access to Information Act (PAIA) requests for information were successful, with the rest refused or ignored. There is also the serious threat posed by the Secrecy Bill.

- Green for state of communication and ICT policy seems over-optimistic. For example, many commentators observe that South Africa has very poor Internet access in terms of number of users, quality of access and cost when compared to other countries at a similar level of development. Further, many commentators agree that the policy development process has been slow and flawed, and that some of the institutions involved had been more of a hindrance than a help.

- A yellow for media is perhaps over-pessimistic. South Africa has a free and relatively vibrant media.

- A green for education is definitely over-optimistic. There is widespread agreement that there are serious problems with the education system in the country. The problems are especially severe in areas such as mathematics and science.

Knowledgeable commentators suggested that the outlook was positive in respect of ICT policy. The appointment of Yunus Carrim of Minister of Communication was reported to have given impetus to policy development and a green paper on ICT policy was expected within weeks. One commentator noted substantial improvements over recent years in that Internet users were not paying less for more, with current prices similar to global norms. However, he went on to say that this had happened despite, rather than because of, government. In particular, Altech's court challenge of the Minister of Communications had resulted in the issuing of telecom licences and resultant improvements in quality Internet access. However, the full benefit of improvements as well as City-led initiatives in respect of fibre would take about five years longer to reach ordinary users than it took to reach business users (personal communication, Alan Levin).

Another expert said that only between12-40% of the population could currently afford to access acceptable quality Internet (personal communication, Dominic Cull). An estimated 36% of the population is close to fibre optic nerve, while mobile 3G nerve is available to more than 80%. However, affordability remains a serious problem. Substantial improvements are hoped for in this area over the next two years.

A recent presentation by Peter Benjamin (2012), founder of Cell-Life, suggests that 8 million South Africans access Internet through a computer, 10,2 million through mobile, while 11 million use MXit. In total, there are an estimated 42,5 million cellphone users (in a population of around 51 million), of whom 25% have basic phones that can do voice, SMS and USSD (unstructured supplementary service data) text menus; 65% have feature phones that have a basic Internet connection (general packet radio service (GPRS)), while the remaining 10% have smartphones (what Benjamin describes as a "full computer in your hand"). Benjamin's presentation claims that approximately 90% of youth and adults in South Africa "have a cellphone". This seems over-optimistic as the 2001 Census found that 89% of *households* (rather than individuals) own a cellphone in working order (compared to 21% with access to computers and 15% with access to a landline). The Internet Society of South Africa estimates that 69% of Internet users are male (Right2Know, 2013: 12).

Thinyane and Coulson (undated) note that South Africa's 100,5 mobile phone subscriptions per 100 inhabitants reflects a higher penetration than those of Namibia, Kenya, Nigeria and India, but a bit lower than that of Brazil. There are nearly 12 mobile phone subscriptions for every fixed telephone line in South Africa.

Goldstuck (2012) reports that the mobile networks report 63 million active accounts, suggestion penetration of 126%. However, this high number is inflated by widespread use of dual-SIM cards, switchboard systems, and cases where GSM signals are used to track fleets or livestock. After adjustment, about 40 million South Africans – 80% of the population – are estimated to use cellphones. World Wide Worx, Goldstuck's company, estimates Internet penetration (including through smartphones) at around 17%.

Ownership of a cellphone also does not mean that the individual or household has meaningful access. Data from the National Income Dynamics Survey reveal that there are many people who have access to a cellphone but do not use it (personal communication, Kathleen Diga). Cost presents a serious barrier with South Africa ranked 30th in Africa in terms of costs of

mobile communication (Kajee, 2013), and 77th of 82 countries reviewed by the International Telecommunications Union (Right2Know, 2013:13). As in other areas, it is more expensive to be poor in that poorer users do not get special deals, and pre-paid SMS is the most expensive service, substantially more expensive than data or post-paid services. The cost to the user of a pre-paid SMS is hundreds of times bigger than the cost incurred by the cellphone company (Right2Know, 2013: 16). Low-cost smartphones produced by Chinese companies are expected to be available in South Africa during 2014, but the cost of both the instrument and user costs will remain out of reach of many citizens and, in particular, out of the reach of those whose voices most urgently need to be heard by government.

Goldstuck (2012) notes that user pay a rental charge for ADSL in addition to about R140 (in 2012) for phone line rental. Average monthly spending on cellphone use is estimated at R100. In April 2012 the Independent Communications Authority of South Africa (ICASA), which is the official regulator, announced that the component of ADSL charges paid by Internet service providers for delivering data across Telkom network to end users had to be reduced by 30%.

In terms of social medial, in mid-2013 5,3 million South Africans were reported to be using Facebook on the Web, 6,8 million accessed Facebook on their phones, 2,4 million were on Twitter, 9,4 million on MXit, and 1,9 million on LinkedIn. There were almost twice as many urban users of Facebook than rural although the population as a whole is relatively evenly divided between urban and rural (IT News Africa, 2013).

The Constitution of 1996 provides a solid legislative basis for most of the core issues address by MAVC. The Bill of Rights within the Constitution guarantees the right to individual privacy (including in respect of communication; freedom of expression; assembly, demonstration, picket and petition; freedom of association; political rights; access to information, and just administrative action. Chapter 9 of the Constitution also provides for the establishment of a range of state institutions to support constitutional democracy. These include, among others, the Public Protector, the Human Rights Commission, the Commission for Gender Equality, the Auditor-General, and the Electoral Commission. The same chapter provides for an independent authority to regulate broadcasting.

A research document commissioned by the South African Local Government Association (SALGA) in collaboration with the Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) explains how the Municipal Financial Management Act and Municipal Structures Act promote and require public participation and access to information at local level (SALGA-GIZ, 2012). (South Africa is, however, unusual among developing countries in that local government is not responsible for the major services of education, health and social development. The main responsibility for delivery of these services lies at the provincial level.)

While the legislative picture might look promising, there is cause for concern. The Promotion of Access to Information Act (PAIA) is the country's main freedom of information legislation. Its provisions are good, but organisations that have attempted to use it report multiple problems.

The Protection of State Information Bill evoked substantial public outrage, as typified by the widespread support which the Right2Know (R2K) campaign was able to mobile, including through marches, demonstrations and the like. The Bill, which R2 and many others refer to as the Secrecy Bill, has undergone some amendments over the year in response to the protests. However, serious concerns remain, including (but not limited to) the limited nature of the public interest defence, criminalisation of members of the public who possess share classified information, loopholes in espionage offences, extremely severe sentences, and the ease with which information can be classified. The bill's passage through the various stages has been accompanied by the ongoing saga of "Nkandlagate", which has heightened concern about government use of legislation to prevent access to information that should be public.

South Africa was one of the founding members of the Open Government Partnership. The first national action plan focused on improving service delivery, fighting corruption, and encouraging citizen participation. The commitment in terms of citizen participation read as follows:

> Develop a citizen participation guideline for public sector departments that ensures that every public sector department across all spheres has a functional, resourced, and capacitated citizen engagement unit, which regularly and proactively engages with civil society. This guideline will give direction to public service departments on citizen engagement in service delivery and policy-making through, among others, the use of online and mobile technology. Participatory democracy will be enhanced.

The independent review of South Africa's performance on its first action plan noted that a draft citizen participation guideline had been developed. However, it seemed that it had not yet been finalised and the reviewer was unable to obtain a copy. The commitment to develop such a guideline had, in fact, existed before South Africa became part of the Open Government Partnership (Mathekga, 2013).

Non-governmental stakeholders

The focus in this section is on non-governmental actors that use – or plan to use – technology in innovative ways to make citizens' voices heard. The term "actors" is used to indicate that the discussion includes non-governmental organisations (NGOs), but also includes academic and other institutions, associations, commercial undertakings, and various individuals. The discussion does not for the most part include actors that use social media or other technology for communication or even advocacy without having a programme of some sort around it or use it in particularly innovative ways. The entries are listed in alphabetical order.

The entries below do, however, include some actors who do not fall squarely within MAVC's focus areas. These are included to give a sense of the breadth of the mapping exercise, as well as the extent to which informants asked for ideas using the "snowball" approach struggled to understand the exact focus of MAVC. Also worth noting is that most of the (NGO) people interviewed had heard about MAVC, although there were a few key organisations that

surprisingly had not. The keen interest shown by many in MAVC is likely, at least in part, to be a reflection of the severe funding crisis that has been facing NGOs in recent years.

The actors covered below include some media and journalism initiatives. One of the HIVOS documents states that "data-driven interactive journalism" will form an important part of MAVC, while other MAVC documents are silent on media.

Afesis-Corplan

Afesis-Corplan is based in East London, has 11 staff, and focuses mainly on the Eastern Cape. It is, however, part of several national networks. The organisation recently established an interactive Youth, Development and Democracy website as a close-out activity with funding from the Raith Foundation. The new website will provide a platform for youth to learn about democracy through reading articles and other information; debate amongst themselves using social media tools; and undertake other activities supported by the website. The organisation launched the website through a conference held in November 2013.

Association for Progressive Communicators

The Association for Progressive Communications (APC) is a technical partner to the MAVC initiative. APC is a global network of civil society organisations that work on Internet and related issues. APCWomen is a programme within APC. While the executive director and some staff of APC are based in South Africa, most of the work happens in other countries. South African members of APC are the Community Education Computer Society, South African NGO Network, and Ungana-Afrika (which also operates beyond South Africa).

In recent years APC Women and Womensnet (a former APC member which has since closed) have promoted digital storytelling. This is an approach developed by the Centre for Digital Storytelling in California which allows for the use of telling of stories and monitoring of subsequent change as an advocacy tool. In South Africa, the tool has been used by APCWomen and Womensnet for advocacy on violence against women in particular, while Open Society has used it for HIV and AIDS. Womensnet also assisted Just Associates in use of digital storytelling in South Africa.

APCWomen's Jennifer Radloff worked together with the African Gender Institute's Selina MudaVhanu (see below) in supporting the creation of a video as part of the Saartjie Baartman Women's Centre's emergency fundraising appeal. The appeal successfully used this video alongside other social networking tools.

Internationally, APC has played a key role in ensuring that the civil society voice is heard in international, regional and national policy-making related to ICT. It has established strong relationships with key actors at global, regional and national level, including governments, regulators, private sector, technical people and researchers and research institutes in addition to civil society organisations. APC can be an important source of information and introductions for MAVC to women "techies", among others.

Black Sash

Black Sash is a national organisation with four regional offices (Cape Town, Durban, Johannesburg and Port Elizabeth) but reach across all nine provinces through an extended network of approximately 300 community-based organisations (CBOs). Sash partners with these organisations for education, awareness raising, information and monitoring government service delivery. Of the CBOs, approximately two-thirds are advice offices. Black Sash itself has 25 permanent and 10 project-specific staff, alongside volunteers and interns.

Sash's Community Monitoring and Advocacy Project (CMAP) is of particular relevance for our purposes. CMAP was piloted and then taken to scale with European Union and Open Society funding. A total of 270 CBOs acted as community facilitators, for a process that brought people together in community platforms for learning and reflection on service rights, governance and recourse. After being educated, monitors used standardised questionnaires on norms and standards to monitor facilities and services. The monitoring focused on application for and payment of social grants, clinics, and Home Affairs offices. For each of these there was a separate questionnaire and there were also questionnaires for local services for households. CMAP forms were in English but responses could be given in other languages. Training was in local languages.

CMAP used "paper and pen into an envelope" that was sent to Sash for capturing. A formal evaluation confirmed the worth of the initiative and consultations held after project funding ended resulted in 108 organisations partnering in a proposal being submitted to Citizens in Action (Citizens' Movement). The intention is to broad CMAP's focus to police, courts and education. Meanwhile, although the initial funding has ended, some monitors continue to send completed questionnaires to Sash. These have, among others, informed Black Sash's on-going advocacy and engagement with government in respect of (possibly illegal) deductions being made from grants.

The evaluation and reflection on CMAP identified areas for improvement, including the cumbersome movement of information from rural areas to Sash. Sash then partnered with Info4Africa to test cellphone capture of questionnaires in KwaZulu-Natal and northern Limpopo. The application used drop-down lists on simple cellphones. Many monitors were "very uncomfortable" with the innovation. In particular, monitors disliked the fact that their previous responses were "invisible" to them, whereas with paper questionnaires they could see the questionnaires and their responses as a whole.

Sash's proposal to the global MAVC call involves a partnership with Keystone (the agency supporting government's community monitoring system) to develop a web-based feedback commons which will store the raw data, generate simple reports, and allow benchmarking of findings.

The South African Social Security Agency (SASSA) engaged well with CMAP. Their involvement included approval of the questionnaire, instructing officials and contractors to provide access to monitors, and providing access to decision-makers. Department of Home Affairs, in contrast, was the least willing to engage.

Cape TV

Cape TV is a community TV channel which, unlike many other community media initiatives, has resisted any commercialisation. It serves as a platform for community interests and voices primarily on socio-economic and political issues of concern to the broader community in the Western Cape. While partly about voices, it is more about information and education. It provides opportunities for volunteers and interns who have video production skills to develop their skills further, and provides opportunities for organisations and other groups to work with video producers to produce programmes that inform, entertain and educate Cape Town's residents.

Cape TV approached both the provincial and city governments to explore a partnership that would not threaten their independence but that could provide slots for government and funding for Cape TV. The responses were generally negative, with government suggesting that Cape TV should partner with business. Government's central information service, the CGIS, was supportive when Jimmy Manyi headed the institution. Cape TV has also received funding and other support from the Media Diversity Development Agency.

Cape TV has a small score staff and relies primarily on volunteers, part-timers and interns. Funders include Interfund, SAMWUMED, Cape Nature, Goethe Institute, Percy Fox Foundation, Cape Film Commission, Open Society Foundation, Human Rights foundation, Radio Netherlands Training Institute, Media Diversity Development Agency, Friedrich Ebert Stiftung, Western Cape Department of Economic Development and Tourism as well as corporate sponsors and donors.

Cell-Life

Cell-Life aims to use – and help others to use – technology to promote health and well-being. Cellphones are the technology of choice because they are currently the most widely used technology. Cell-Life began operations in Cape Town in 2000 but now does work in other parts of South Africa as well as elsewhere in Africa.

Cell-Life was among the most commonly-named organisations by other informants. In particular, its Lungisa project was relatively well-known. Lungisa is a monitoring and reporting tool that allows community members to report on services provided by the City Council. It uses USSD, MXit and SMS platforms. Residents report problems to Lungisa (Cell-Life) and Lungisa takes the report to the City Council and reports back to the user. Cell-Life piloted Lungisa in Khayelitsha with the Social Justice Coalition (see below) but now wants to expand to other townships. Reporting is done by dialling *120*852# and following instructions. The main challenge encountered has been educating community members on the benefits of reporting rather than technological problems. Well over half of the reported problems are resolved, in the sense that the person reporting is satisfied. As at 26 November 2013, the Lungisa website recorded that 1 151 (73%) of the 1 581 problems reported to date had been resolved. The Lungisa pilot was funded by Freedom House and Indigo Foundation.

Cell-Life also developed a Mobiliser system, now renamed Communicate, which organisations can use to send bulk word-based SMS to many individuals. The person sending

the SMS is fully in charge of the scheduling and recipients. Cell-Life trains people telephonically and charges 25c per SMS (on a credit account) in addition to an initial charge for setting up and training.

At the time when the latest National Strategic Plan on HIV and AIDS was being developed, Cell-Life was asked to assist with soliciting input through please-call-me. At that point an estimated 4-5 000 people had participated through meetings, email, etc. In the final month, Cell-Life organised for two "shots" of a million SMS each (at R5 000 per million) to be sent out to random cellphones. About 13 000 people responded, asking for more information. A further SMS was sent to those with cellphone numbers encouraging them to respond in one of five different ways. This elicited 10 000 more submissions, although some were very short. A similar exercise for the People's Health Movement in respect of National Health Insurance generated 20 000 responses.

Cell-Life currently has plans to roll out a system for the newly-established Office of Health Standards Compliance to monitor quality of care at clinics. The monitoring will be via USSD and routed to a database. The system will replace the current card-based "tick" system. The cellphone system will circumvent the problem that it is the clinics that perform well that are likely to organise the card system effectively as the cellphone will by-pass clinic staff. The cellphone system has been piloted in some of the National Health Insurance pilot districts.

Cell-Life has a staff of around 25 people. About 60% of its revenue comes from donors and the rest from service provision. Vodacom, the President's Emergency Fund for AIDS Relief (PEPFAR), Norad, and the Canadian International Development Agency are current donors. While Cell-Life itself is an NGO, it has established a wholly-owned commercial company, Mhealth, that generates income for it. Cell-Life also charges for some of its own services.

Civicus

Civicus is a global civil society network which has its head office in Johannesburg. At the time of writing Civicus was developing two Internet-based initiatives. The BE THE CHANGE campaign was launched in November as a space in which users can share stories of actions or campaigns that have led to positive social change, and ask for or offer help to others. The Big Development Dashboard, for which Civicus is still seeking funding, will provide an open-source mechanism for monitoring progress towards the post-2015 development agenda.

Code for South Africa (Code4SA)

Code4SA, and in particular its co-founders Adi Eyal and Gabriella Razzano, were among the actors mentioned most often by others as key players in this field. Code4SA was formally established in August 2013 as a digital democracy catalyst, after 10 months of community consultation and research initiated by AMI and the Open Society Foundation of SA (OSF-SA). Code4SA is intended to drive the open data and (digital) open government movement in South Africa.

Code4SA functions as an affiliate of the continental [Code for Africa](#) network, building its own local solutions and capacity, while also leveraging skills and technologies developed at other country affiliates in Ghana, Kenya, and Nigeria, as well as in the central Code4Africa tech lab.

AMI is Code4SA's founding funder, through its Africa News Innovation Challenge. ANIC invited Eyal and colleagues to submit a proposal through the Open Data and Democracy Initiative (ODADI) for a seed grant to establish a core tech team and to then embed "techies" as Innovation Fellows into newsrooms and social justice NGOs to help "rewire them from the inside". ANIC made an initial $80,000 investment, and has since committed a further $60,000 for additional projects or outreach initiatives. This includes a major focus on 'data liberation' initiatives to digitize or otherwise free key public information (such as machine-readable census, elections, by-law, and public health data) for citizen tools, as well as a drive to build APIs (application programme interfaces) to fast-track cheap and widespread use of data or tech resources by other digital activists. A major AMI-sponsored project, with additional support from the Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation and the World Bank, has Code4SA building an AfricanCommons to create a one-stop portal for re-usable code, data, and skills for social justice and digital democracy projects. AfricanCommons will also include 'white label' tools for people to run their own hackathons or other co-creation events, plus digital 'code' competitions, and volunteer hacktivist networks.

Code4SA's other current projects include running a CitizenLab in Jozihub in Johannesburg, which provides free space and support services in a tech accelerator for up to four digital democracy projects at a time. The CitizenLab will also, in partnership with the Praekelt Foundation, host four Code4Democracy hackathons or other co-creation events in 2014. Code4SA is also running a pilot newsroom fellowship with the Cape Times, which is helping build data-driven analysis and audience engagement tools. Code4SA is also spearheading the creation of [OpenByLaws.org.za](#) through a fellowship to Greg Kemp, and is helping the Parliamentary Monitoring Group build an API to give public access to its parliamentary and political party data (as part of the People's Assembly project) through a fellowship to Geoff K. Other Code4SA APIs include one that allows NGOs and the public to compare the latest medicine prices, and a set of election APIs that help digital activists build election apps.

In a bid avoid duplication, Code4SA is actively partnering with NGOs to help them build re-usable solutions. This includes a partnership with the Institute for Security Studies to build better ways to track and monitor public corruption, and with Media Monitoring Africa to build a database that profiles and tracks public figures / organizations during the elections. Code4SA has also partnered with the Open Democracy Advice Centre (ODAC) on a housing project in Dido Valley in Redhill in Cape Town. The project aims to assist residents of an informal settlement who have been promised new housing for nine years. Initially the intention was to make the housing waiting lists transparent. However, the partners discovered that such lists did not exist. The focus now is therefore on developing a communication channel for Cape Town City to keep people informed. For residents, there will be a mobile phone interface with USSD for questions and complaints.

Code4SA is seeking to diversify its funding, through proposals to OSF-SA, MAVC, and others for core funding for its tech team to serve as an alternative source of technical expertise to civil society organisations that currently rely on expensive private consultancies. They aim to work as a "partner" to such organisations rather than simply a "supplier" and their charges are based only on costs.

Congress of South African Trade Unions

The Congress of South African Trade Unions (COSATU) has a Twitter handle and a Facebook page which it uses to disseminate information. COSATU issues a daily news bulletin, COSATU Today, which carries the federation's messages and statements of affiliates and other civil society organisations. The suspended general secretary, Zwelinzima Vavi, has more than 100 000 followers on Twitter.

Corruption Watch

Corruption Watch was established in January 2012 to gather, analyse and share information on corruption in South Africa. It uses technology for receiving reports of corruption as well as to provide information to educate people about the fight against corruption. In the organisation's first eleven months, (only) 22% of reported corruption was at municipal level. For 2013, the organisation has focused on four issues, with the main issue being a campaign around corruption in schools. The focus was chosen on the basis of the number of reports received in the previous year. The other focus issues for 2013 are corruption in small towns, youth and procurement. These issues have been looked at mainly in terms of how they relate to the schools focus.

The organisation's first campaign was on bribery on the roads. The complaints received allowed for identification of hotspots, and the Johannesburg Metropolitan Police Department and City of Johannesburg responded relatively well in tackling the problem. For the 2013 schools focus, Corruption Watch has had some interaction with the Department of Education in Free State and with the MEC for Education in Gauteng about problems in Soweto.

Initially, complaints could be sent to Corruption Watch through either SMS or Internet, and the majority came through SMS. However, complaints received through SMS generally do not include sufficient information to understand the problem, and therefore need follow-up with the complainant. This is not possible where people have blocked their number from showing or use someone else's cellphone. Those laying the complaint also incur the cost of the SMS. Corruption Watch therefore recently established a toll-free landline which allows for full details of the complaint to be captured. Both the SMS and cellphone routes allow people to use whatever language they choose, and Corruption Watch also produces media material in several languages. However, the website is only English.

Corruption Watch is an energetic user of social media and claims to have more followers on Twitter and Facebook than longer-established organisations such as COSATU and Equal Education.

Corruption Watch is planning to develop further applications for feature phones and smartphones, both for disseminating material and for mobilisation of a "community of corruption fighters". The organisation recognises that use of these phones will limit access for poor people but notes that to date the main group of people reporting to Corruption Watch have been black men with tertiary education.

Corruption Watch has 24 staff, all based in Johannesburg. Its current philanthropic funders are Andrew Roberts Memorial Fund, Atlantic Philanthropies, Aven Limited, Bertha Foundation, Claude Leon Foundation, Ernst & Young, Ford Foundation, Heinrich Boll Stiftung, HIVOS, Millennium Trust, Open Society Foundation SA, Oppenheimer Memorial Trust, Raith Foundation, SAB Limited, Sigrid Rausing Trust, Siobhan Cleary, Stephen Malherbe and Nicky Newton-King

DataFirst

DataFirst is based within the Southern African Labour and Development Research Unit at the University of Cape Town. It is relevant for our purposes from the open data perspective as it hosts South Africa's largest, and best supported, set of microdata from publicly available datasets. The datasets concerned include those produced by Statistics South Africa, as well as a range of other datasets. The agency has a contract with the Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development to provide training and support to statistical agencies in other parts of the continent to improve public availability of quality datasets.

The Statistics South Africa datasets are also available on the agency's own website. DataFirst adds value by subjecting the data to the same checks applied to all other datasets received by DataFirst. The checking covers both disclosure of content and quality. Where received datasets are not labelled or do not have metadata, DataFirst either provides this service itself or assists the data producer to do so. Where problems with the data are encountered, DataFirst checks with the data producer, assists where possible with corrections and, where necessary, creates new versions of the data that record cautions in respect of the problems. Since 2010, DataFirst has a formal agreement in place with Statistics South Africa that provides for collaboration in these respects.

DataFirst does not charge for its services and provides a free on-line help service. The organisation does, however, restrict access to a small number of datasets. For these datasets it has established a secure data service, the first in Africa. Currently people accredited to use these data must do so in a special room on the university's premises. In the future, the secure data service may be available online.

DataFirst has funding until end 2013 from the Mellon Foundation, receives some funding from a university strategic fund, and also earns money through its contract with the Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development.

Equal Education

Equal Education describes itself as a "movement of learners, parents, teachers and community members working for quality and equality in South African education, through analysis and activism." The head office is in Khayelitsha, Cape Town but activities increasingly have a national scope.

The movement uses Twitter and Facebook and is developing a MXit platform. It uses bulk SMS to notify members about meetings and campaigns, has an email database of about 10 000 and provides for donations to be made on-line.

Equal Education does not have any focused projects that use technology to make their voices heard by government. Nevertheless, it was assessed as the most successful NGO user of technology for this purpose by the NPO Network (see below) on the basis of its development and dissemination of a video as part of its campaign for the Minister of Education to issue norms and standards for school infrastructure. As part of this same campaign, in June 2012 Equal Education used the hashtag #Questions4Motshekga in the leadup to a news conference by the Minister for Basic Education, Angie Motshekga. The hashtag became a trending topic.

Equal Education's media officer described the use of social media for this campaign as follows.
- The video was completed by the Rodeo Productions and released on YouTube and to our Facebook friends and Twitter followers.
- Equal Education paid $20 for a post to promote it on Facebook to its friends.
- The organisation tweeted about it as often as every hour. A staff member walked around the office making sure everyone was tweeting.
- The organisations sent an email to its membership explaining the campaign and video and asking them to do three things: Watch it, Tweet/Facebook about it, Send it to their contacts.[1]

Good Governance Learning Network

The Good Governance Learning Network (GGLN) is made up of both full and associate members. Full membership is open to South African NGOs and academic institutions that have at least one core programme that focuses on issues related to good governance at the local level. Associate membership is open to organisations, institutions, academics and consultants working in the field of local government.

Full members as at November 2013 are Afesis Corplan; African Centre for Citizenship and Democracy; Black Sash; Built Environment Support Group; Centre for Policy Studies; Centre for Public Participation; Community Connections; Community Law Centre; Community Organisation Resource Centre; Democracy Development Programme; Development Action Group; Eastern Cape NGO Coalition; Electoral Institute of South Africa; Fair Share; Foundation for Contemporary Research; Institute for Democracy in South

[1] http://www.nonprofit-network.org/index.php/how-to/case-studies/item/south-african-organisations-getting-it-right-case-study-1-equal-education

Africa [closed]; Isandla Institute; Mvula Trust [suspended]; Parliamentary Monitoring Group; Project for Conflict Resolution and Development; Planact; Socio-Economic Rights Institute; and Trust for Community Outreach. MobiSAM and Glenn Hollands, both discussed below, are associate members.

The Network's model has three tiers – members' meetings, managers' meetings (mainly about funding) and giving small grants of about R30 000. The grants are for events (to which other members must be invited) or research (ideally involving other members). The Network also produces the State of Local Government Report. Isandla Institute acts as the secretariat for the Network.

A joint email request was sent to all GGLN members asking if they had initiatives relevant to MAVC other than new proposed initiatives for which they had responded to the global call for proposals. The email request elicited only one response which was not already covered.

Groundup

Groundup is a community journalist project which produces a weekly online collection of stories from South Africa's townships. Many of the stories relate to health. The weekly offering includes opinion pieces, with a preference for pieces written by people who live and work in working class areas. The initiative provides training for all those who work on the project, all of whom were previously social movement activists. University of Cape Town students interested in careers in journalism do the sub-editing. GroundUp is coordinated by the Community Media Trust and supported by the Centre for Social Science Research at the University of Cape Town.

Health-e

Health-e is a non-profit news agency, established in 1999, that supplies news to the mainstream media. The agency has a broad definition of health that covers socio-economic issues more generally. It has a retainer with Independent Newspapers, and also has plans to establish relationships with Caxton and the Sun.

Health-e was a collaborator within the DFID-funded Southern African Regional Programme on Access to Medicine. Other countries participating in the initiative were Lesotho, Zimbabwe, Mozambique, Malawi, Zambia, Democratic Republic of Congo and Tanzania. The element on which Health-e collaborated involved monitoring of medicine stock-outs at health clinics, with the focus in South Africa on clinics in districts that are serving as pilots for South Africa's National Health Insurance (NHI).

Health-e uses the services of 20 citizen journalists who are provided with tablets and paid per story delivered. The journalists are based in NHI pilot districts as well as some other districts which do not generally get median attention from mainstream media. The journalists are tasked with recording both positive and negative stories.

The journalists' current tasks include checking on availability of medicines under the DFID-funded project, but the citizen journalists had already been in place for some months before

Health-e joined this particular project. The DFID funding was available for six months, and only one month remained at the time of the interview. Health-e also managed to raise a small additional amount from the Swiss arm of the Open Foundation for the clinic monitoring, and the citizen journalists will continue beyond the life of the DFID-funded project.

The medicine-monitoring app allows monitoring of 12 medicines. The medicines monitored are rotated from among a list of 20 key medicines provided by the Department of Health. The project has been implemented with good collaboration from the Department, which supplied the list of medicines, gave permission for regular checking at clinics, and has responded to reported stockouts. The project has also linked up with Stop the Stockouts (an informal coalition made up of Rural Doctors Association. Section 27, Treatment Action Campaign and the HIV Clinicians Society) which has a hotline for reporting of stockouts. At the start of the DFID-funded project there were regular stockouts in the clinics monitored, whereas by the fifth month no stockouts were reported. The project reports are publicly available on the regional project website (named Tendai), but there are plans to move them to the Health-e website to make them more easily available.

The medicine app would work on cellphones, but Health-e provides its citizen journalists with tablets because of the difficulties of writing stories on cellphones. Health-e is developing a map system on their website that will allow users to locate the clinic nearest them and also provide other information on the relevant clinic, including any stories reported by the citizen journalists.

Health-e has seven staff members in addition to the citizen journalists.

Hillside Digital

Hillside Digital's Siyakhona project is providing training to youth to become citizen video journalists and human rights activists. The project is supported by Indigo Foundation.

Impilo Foundation

Impilo Foundation in Zandspruit, an informal settlement in the Greater Johannesburg area, has a project that trains citizen journalists who can submit stories using technology. The Foundation uses SMS to disseminate government announcements, for example about local meetings. Impilo also has plans to assist citizens to submit questions to political representatives. The Foundation receives funding from Indigo Foundation.

Impumelelo Social Innovation Centre

Impumelelo is an awards programme that rewards innovative initiatives in respect of service delivery, and particularly those at local level. Over the years the Centre's activities have expanded to include training, case study research, and documentation and publication of best practice. Although Impumelelo was founded in 1999, none of the initiatives chosen to date seems to fit neatly within the MAVC focus.

International Budget Partnership

The International Budget Partnership (IBP) has its head office in Washington DC, but has staff stationed in several countries, including South Africa. IBP's main objective is to strengthen the ability of civil society organisations to analyse government budgets and engage in budget advocacy. It does this, among others, through provision of technical assistance and funding to civil society organisations.

South Africa is one of several countries in which IBP plans to support organisations over the next few years with funding from the Gates Foundation. The focus of the support and the organisations to be assisted has still not been decided, but is likely to link to government service delivery.

In recent years IBP has provided support to Social Justice Coalition (SJC) and Ndifuna Ukwazi (NU) (in particular for a social audit on sanitation), Public Service Accountability Monitor (on health care), Centre for Economic Governance and AIDS in Africa and Treatment Action Campaign (expenditure tracking in respect of HIV and AIDS). The support was provided using funds from the Gates Foundation. Only SCJ and NU used technologies in ways that could be relevant for our purposes (see below).

Media for Justice

Media for Justice is a news agency that aims to get "voices from the ground" heard, in particular using 20-minute videos. Gillian Schutte and Sipho Singiswa head this initiative and established it as an NGO two and a half years ago. The partners bring other people in for particular projects and also train people as citizen journalists.

Media for Justice claims some successes in getting government to listen. These include having the MEC of housing in KwaZulu-Natal call a meeting one day after a video was shown, after a long period in which there had been no official reaction. Mainstream news agencies have also started to use Media for Justice's materials.

Currently the organisation has no external funding but it has applied to Open Society. Media for Justice has partnered with Melissa Steyn of Diversity Studies at the University of Witwatersrand, giving the project an action-research aspect.

MobiSAM

MobiSAM is an initiative spearheaded by Hannah Thinyane of the Computer Science Department of Rhodes University in Grahamstown. It is included here rather than under research because of the extent of "action" in this action-research project. Thinyane developed the initiative with Debbie Coulson, who previously worked for the Centre for Social Accountability (earlier known as the Public Service Accountability Monitor). The MobiSAM project has funding from Ford Foundation for a 2½-year period which ends in December 2014.

MobiSAM focuses on water, which has been an ongoing problem area in Grahamstown (Makana municipality), a municipality which was ranked as the third worst performing in the Eastern Cape (Thinyane, 2013). The first year and a half of the project were spent on background research on service delivery followed by development of the MobiSAM apps. In developing the apps, Thinyane aimed to meet several requirements, namely: multilingual support; support for a wide variety of phones; minimum cost; support for different types of polling questions including question types defined by the user; visualisation of collated results; and interoperability with (ability to import into) existing systems of both raw data and visualisations.

The instruments developed included both mobile apps and a web-based polling system which registered users can use to create polls and send them to other users. The responses are collated and converted into pie charts, bar charts and heat maps as they are received. The technological development was followed by training of monitors. The intention was to train community members, but in practice many of the trainees were journalists of Grocotts Mail, a local newspaper. In 2014, training will be extended to more community members, and in particular to members of the Kowie Catchment Campaign.

MobiSAM allows for the municipality to receive and respond to reports of problems by individuals, and also for the municipality to inform residents of reasons for outages and how long they might last. MobiSAM utilises SMS but also Facebook so as to allow for dialogue and interaction with the municipality. The SMS app was developed using api tools downloaded from clickatell.co.za.

Thinyane and Coulson initially interacted with an acting municipal manager who simultaneously occupied the posts of city engineer and director of technical and infrastructure division and had previous experience of use of cellphones in Knysna. The manager who replaced this person was similarly excited about the initiative, and the Makana council then passed a resolution authorising MobiSAM. However, it then took more than six months for the memorandum of agreement to be signed.

The municipality hired a person to respond to complaints, with a commitment (recorded in the memorandum) that complaints would be attended to within one working day of receipt. However, at the time of the interviews responses were being delayed because the municipal protocol required that all communication go through their official spokesperson instead of the MobiSAM official being able to respond immediately. The team hopes that this and any other teething problems will be sorted out. The memorandum allows for Makana to use the tools after the Ford funding ends. It also provides that information on past problems will not be deleted, so that there is a record of problems over time. A Grocott's article quotes the municipality as saying that they planned to use trained community development workers to assist people with registering on their mobile phones where necessary.

Thinyane and Coulson had initially intended to gather and analyse information from the service delivery and budget implementation plans mandated by the Municipal Financial Management Act. They dropped this idea after seeing the flaws in these documents, and also

being told that the documents were drawn up because this was a requirement but were not really used.

MobiSAM is different from the Mobilitate tool developed by Kaiziania in that it includes a social accountability and mobilisation element alongside reporting.

Ndifuna Ukwazi

Ndifuna Ukwazi is a partner organisation to the Social Justice Coalition. In essence, NU provides research and technical support to the more membership-based SJC. Of particular interest for our purposes is the partnership on the Imali Yethu programme on budgets for service delivery, which experimented with social audits, and the subsequent on-going work with the Lungisa application developed in the pilot with Cell-Life. These are described below in the section on SJC.

NU is also attempting to get copies of all the City's service delivery agreements that are relevant for Khayelitsha. Where these are obtained, NU hopes to convert them into more useable formats and also work with the City so that the City makes these documents accessible on their websites. NU's experience to date suggests that one of the biggest challenges in undertaking this sort of work is identifying the right individuals within the City to gain access and information.

Open Data and Democracy Initiative

The Open Data and Democracy Initiative (ODADI) is 'roundtable' forum intended to serve as a coordination and information sharing mechanism for local social justice NGOs, digital pioneers, and donors interested in digital democracy.

ODADI was initiated by AMI and Open Society Foundation of South Africa (OSF-SA) in May 2012, at a time when no notable open data (which is distinct from access-to-info or other freedom of information) initiatives were active in South Africa. ODADI kicked off with inaugural roundtables first in Cape Town and then in Johannesburg, bringing together AMI and OSF-SA grantees with other strategic partners to discuss how to kickstart open data and citizen-driven digital democracy initiatives across the country. A second round of discussions targeted institutional members of the Social Justice Network, with civil society activists such as Jay Naidoo and Gustav Praekelt (of the Praekelt Foundation) invited to explain how global NGOs were successfully harnessing open data and civic technologies.

The meetings prompted the watershed Code4Democracy hackathon in Cape Town in August 2012, which attracted over 250 'hacktivists' (activist technologists), data journalists, and civil society representatives. The event was funded by AMI and is credited with being the first civic hackathon (an event, typically lasting several days, in which a large number of people meet to engage in collaborative computer programming) in South Africa focusing on democracy and social justice issues. The event sparked a number of pilot projects and initiatives, including experimentation with data visualization by NGOs such as Ndifuna

Ukwazi, experimentation with data scraping and data-driven apps by PMG, and open data campaigns such as those championed by Right2Know.

AMI froze funding support for ODADI in early 2013, when members failed to endorse the original model for ODADI to serve as a top-level coordination mechanism for institutions / organisations.

ODADI's primary activity since has been as an ideas forum, with a Google Group discussion list connecting both organizations and individuals interested in open data and digital democracy. Code4SA's Adi Eyal plays a leading role in maintaining the list and seeding discussion. Eyal views activity on the ODADI discussion list as "pretty low", and points to overlap in membership and interests with other communities, such as the AMI-supported Hacks/Hackers chapters in Johannesburg and Cape Town, the Open Knowledge Foundation chapter in Cape Town, and CodefSA itself.

Recurrent issues discussed on the list include ongoing concern at the lack of "bottom-up" citizen demand for open data. The group has, however, given birth to a number of practical initiatives. Cell-Life's Lungisa project (discussed elsewhere in this report) was reportedly inspired by ODADI. Greg Kempe's OpenByLaws initiative to make to codify and digitize municipal by laws in machine-readable form is another. The by laws are currently only available either in paper or PDF format. Kempe has won a Code4SA fellowship for the work, which involves making a full set of municipal laws easily available for both civic watchdogs and digital entrepreneurs to build 3rd party 'citizen' apps. At this point the Cape Town dataset is near completion, and Kempe has approached various funders to help complete the work and make the tools available to other municipalities in South Africa and beyond.

A third ODADI-inspired initiative (driven by Eyal) is advocacy aimed at removing copyright restrictions placed on commercial and other use of data produced with public money, such as data of the Municipal Demarcation Board, Independent Election Commission, national parliament, and Statistics South Africa.

Open Democracy Advice Center

The Open Democracy Advice Centre (ODAC) is a small-ish organisation, with four full-time staff. Its main funders are Open Society Foundation and Ford Foundation. It has several initiatives, all in the early development stage, that are relevant for our purposes.

In housing, as noted above, ODAC is working together with Code4SA in the Redhill informal settlement. This project is funded by Ford Foundation.

In the area of victim empowerment, ODAC hopes to develop a system that would provide victims with the information they need at all stages of their case through a cellphone interface. This would include the initial application, as well as all subsequent stages of the case. The app would use SMS, USSD and MXit interfaces so as to be accessible through all types of cellphones. ODAC has secured informal cooperation from the National Prosecution

Agency in respect of some of the relevant data. One challenge will be how to deal with cases, which are common, where the victim's cellphone number changes. ODAC is partnering with Code4SA on the technical side and with Clairwood Consulting on the legal side. ODAC has applied to MAVC for this project.

For the local government level, ODAC is working on providing Internet access to the integrated development plans (IDPs) that all municipalities are required to produce. An IDP database was reportedly previously developed by the Department of Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs (COGTA) but the department was not clear where to house it and it was not effective. There are now plans to re-launch the database. This initiative is funded by the Friedrich Ebert Stiftung.

The askAFRICA project aims to create a continental portal for access-to-information requests, offering digital tools for both NGOs and the public to file and track requests, see information already 'liberated' by other requesters, and then analyze the resulting information. askAFRICA will also allow citizens and activists to build communities of interest around specific issues or even specific documents. The project is piloting its tools in South Africa, designing specifically for the country's Promotion of Access to Information Act regulations. The pilot version will translate an information request into the format appropriate for PAIA, identify and route it to the correct official, provide feedback to the requester, and where appropriate will connect them to specialist NGOs or legal advice centers to offer assistance if the request is refused. The project builds on top of platforms developed by mySociety in the UK, Sunlight Foundation in the US, and will also tap into document analysis technologies such as DocumentCloud.org. The pilot version of askAFRICA is being developed as for the responsible web (desktop, tablet, smartphone), with a planned future version for feature phones. AMI's Africa News Innovation Challenge provided the funding, with additional technical support from AMI's Code for Africa labs.

Open Knowledge Foundation

The Open Knowledge Foundation established its South Africa chapter, in Cape Town, in 2012 but it is unfunded, relies completely on volunteers and has struggled to get going. The chapter was intended to bring together technologists with scientists, academics, cultural activists, and human rights activists to forge an open data culture in the country. The chapter has hosted infrequent member meet-ups, but has not staged any wider public events and has not yet championed any local projects.

AMI signed an MoU with OFK global in late 2013, and has pledged part sponsorship of a shared community coordinator for one year, starting February 2014. The coordinator will manage membership activities, and will seek opportunities for collaboration between the OKF chapter and other initiatives. The coordinator will work out of the CitizenLab in Johannesburg, and will be managed by Code4SA.

Opposition to Urban Tolling Alliance

The Opposition to Urban Tolling Alliance (OUTA) brings together more than 11 000 individuals and business in opposition to implementation of e-tolling on Gauteng's freeways. The alliance has used social media as a tool to garner support and raise awareness alongside other activities, including court challenges.

Parliamentary Monitoring Group

The Parliamentary Monitoring Group (PMG) creates parliamentary records and provides public access to information on what happens in the "engine room" of parliament, namely the parliamentary committees. It does this both through audio recordings and through minutes and summaries prepared to monitors who attend the meetings. Parliament itself does not provide this service.

The organisation has five full-time staff, three interns and a much larger number of part-time monitors. The monitors are paid per meeting. PMG's system for recording committee meetings has been in place for many years and is well-used. For example, in the period March to August 2013 the PMG site had an average of close on 50 000 unique visitors per month, and an average of close on 140 000 visits.

The website is currently undergoing major redevelopment, by mySociety in the UK, and will be relaunched in early 2014 as the People's Assembly, with improved access to transcripts and original documentation, as well as information on parliamentarians, constituency offices, and other legislative resources. The AMI is sponsoring an Innovation Fellow, through Code4SA, to further strengthen the mySociety improvements by building APIs (application programme interfaces) onto the new website, to allow for automated access by 3rd party civic watchdogs, digital entrepreneurs, and even ordinary citizens who would be interested in building their own mobile apps, websites, or other services on top of PMG data.

As an example of one such app, Code4SA is helping PMG develop RepLocator as a simple responsive web (desktop, tablet, smartphone) application that will allow users to find out who the MP for their local constituency is, where the office is located, and how to contact them. Over time, PMG will add further information about the MP's performance and the constituency itself to the app. The project is intended to promote accountability, by helping citizens ensure that MPs spend at least one quarter of their time dealing with constituency issues as required by the Constitution. Initial plans to also make the app available on feature phones, with the help of the Praekelt Foundation, were shelved due to SMS costs of 28 cents per message.

Code4SA is also helping PMG explore the possibility for building a Constitution advice app (again, initially as a simple responsible web application for desktop, tablets, and smartphones), as well as a Parliamentary Bill Tracker that seeks to demystify law-making and strengthen public participation in policy formation by helping civic watchdogs and citizens track the public consultation, drafting, public review, and Parliamentary approval process for laws.

AMI is meanwhile in discussion with PMG around a range of other digital innovations, to improve the usefulness of PMG's archives, improve PMG's ability to manage subscription / revenue models using this content, and improve automated digital access (using APIs) to the content.

PMG submitted a formal request to the Parliamentary Oversight Authority Body for access to attendance records of parliamentarians at plenary and committee sessions. The request was refused on the grounds that the current paper-based records are unreliable. PMG hopes that the application will be approved once parliament moves to electronic recording of attendance.

PMG's main current funders are the Open Society Foundation and Raith Foundation. Most of PMG's services are free. However, in 2002 the organisation started charging business for access to the records of the 15 (out of 50) committees that are of commercial interest. These records are therefore closed access, but if NGOs apply they are not charged for access. Since 2009, PMG has also charged government for access to the 15 sites.

Project for Conflict Resolution and Development

The Project for Conflict Resolution and Development is based in Port Elizabeth. It has been supported by Glenn Hollands, previously of Afesis Corplan and now with Mbumba Development Services, to develop a proposal for a project that draws on both Afesis's experience in its Closing the Gap project and what Hollands learnt as a co-author of the SALGA-GIZ report (see below). It also builds on Hollands' experience in training young community journalists through the Journalism Department of Water Sisulu University to read and use budget-related documents of small towns.

The project aims to exploit the legislative requirements within the Municipal Financial Management Act and Municipal Systems Act that require the establishment of independent audit committees in all local governments. Currently these committees are usually not taken seriously by senior managers. The functions of the committees are also very similar to those of the municipal public affairs committees, namely to review the reports of the auditor-general. The composition of the two bodies is, however, very different. The public affairs committee is a sub-committee of the local council, while the audit committees has civil society members and must be chaired by someone who is neither a government employee nor a councillor. Typically private auditors are members of the council and members are paid for their time. The project would encourage the two committees to work together so as to strengthen their impact.

Much of the work of the project will not use ICT. However, there are also plans to find young people – such as accounting students – in the community who can serve as intermediaries, using tablets and mobiles to register citizen opinions. The project would also have a website on which the intermediaries could record feedback.

The plain is to implement the project in Cacadu district municipality. Cacadu was chosen because it is seen as the best-run district municipality in the province, sees its role as facilitating professional support rather than political, and has a strong community liaison

person who would promote it among the local municipalities. The project would use a page on the district's website for feedback. The intermediaries would register on that.

PCRD currently has funding from the Open Society Foundation for meetings with municipal stakeholders.

Right2Know

Right2Know (R2K) focuses on access to information and freedom of expression in the service of social justice. It describes itself as a movement or campaign rather than an organisation. The structure is unusual, with annual provincial summits which are open to all supporters electing a provincial coordinator and a delegation to the national summit. The delegation members are then legally the members of R2K. The members elect a working group, which serves as the board.

R2K was one of the most oft-named organisations when informants were asked for initiatives that should be followed up as potentially relevant for MAVC. This is probably due to its extremely effective use of social media and the Internet.

R2K has ten Facebook administrators and four Twitter account holders. Facebook postings automatically go to Twitter. Use of these media is very lightly regulated, in line with the approach in other parts of R2K. The website serves as the core online part of the campaign and Facebook and Twitter are used to spread news about new things on the website. R2K uses google extensively and was "born" on a google list. It currently has approximately ten google lists. It uses Cell-Life's Mobiliser for mass communication within the movement. It has also experimented with opensource solutions. R2K acknowledges that it use of these tools skews communication to the middle class. Some of those in leadership positions are wary of technology in other respects, including the way it can threaten security. It also questions use of tools such as "please-call-me" if responding to such a call involves no further action on either side.

The bulk of R2K's membership is made up of front-line civic organisations whose primary concern is service delivery. R2K has assisted in linking these organisations with organisations such as South African History Archive and ODAC that have experience with PAIA requests. Its experience suggests that PAIA requests can result in organisations receiving large amounts of documents and data that do not directly answer members' questions. It is only through the work of intermediaries such as researchers, advocacy/legal officers, community organisers and the like that the information may become useful. There reading of the situation is that in many cases what citizens want is access to decision makers who will explain decisions to members rather than access to information.

In addition to use of technology for internal organisational issues, communication, and the like, R2K has a Vula Ma Connexion campaign and information access is one of the four "legs" on which it focuses. Another leg, the "solidarity" leg, has also involved work on information access as R2K has worked with various communities and organisations to assist them in accessing the information they need. Their experience suggests that protests (with

R2K banners and t-shirts) are more effective in achieving access to information, especially where local government is the target, than use of PAIA.

R2K has five paid staff, spread across three office – Cape Town (the effective head office), Durban and Johannesburg. All programme work is done by volunteers and monthly meetings are open to all volunteers. The work has active participation by many other organisations – as many as 130 in a period of two months campaigning. There are also national focus groups on particular issues. These serve as think tanks that feed into the working groups and do policy submissions but do not have authority beyond this.

R2K has, together with ODAC, conceptualised an Opendata project which has been approved by the campaign leadership. The project involves three elements: (a) setting the information access agenda in terms of campaigns, marches and the like, (b) sharing data in the portal based on experience and needs (informed by research commissioned by ODAC (McKinley, 2013)) and (c) setting the research, popular education, agenda, through info-graphics. There are plans to submit a proposal for this project to the European Union, with the focus initially confined to specified topics, such as local government service delivery or climate change. The conceptualisation of the project draws on the findings of research commissioned by ODAC, one of R2K's founding members, based on in-depth interviews with diverse civil society organisations spread across four provinces on their information/open data ideas, experiences and needs (McKinley, 2012).

R2K's current funders include Open Society Foundation, Norwegian Peoples' Aid, Claude Leon Foundation, and three different German political foundations.

Rural Women Action Research Project

This project, which is based in the Law Faculty of the University of Cape Town, has a website, CustomContested, which aims to make available information on the latest bills (such as the Traditional Courts Bill) to facilitate engagement by organisations of and supporting rural women. The project has used an SMS service, Graphicmail.co.za, which has a special rate for non-profit organisations, for bulk SMS and email. At this point the SMS serves only to alert the recipient who must then make contact to receive further information. Ideally, the project would like to find a way for those it works with to receive more information on their cellphones.

Saartjie Baartman Women's Centre

The Saartjie Baartman Women's Centre hosts a shelter for abused women and their children as well as a range of ancillary services. Selina Mudavanhu and colleagues of the Africa Gender Institute and Jenny Radloff of APCWomen collaborated with the Centre in developing a short advocacy video as part of an emergency campaign to address the Centre's funding crisis (Mudavanhu and Radloff, 2013). The video used digital storytelling techniques and was uploaded to websites and social media sites such as Facebook, YouTube, and Twitter. The video was produced using low-tech and low-cost equipment. The aim of the video was to mobilise viewers to email and tweet the Premier of the Western Cape Province, Helen Zille

(an enthusiastic Twitter-user), asking that her government ensure that the Centre remain operational. In response to the tweets and emails, Zille asked the Minister of Social Development to assist the Centre, and R250 000 was made available almost immediately. The amount was substantial, although nowhere near the four million rand required by the Centre each year. Ironically, the media coverage generated by the video and other advocacy activities was estimated by a communications agency to be worth R4 million.

Social Justice Coalition

The Social Justice Coalition (SJC) is an activist grassroots organisation based in Khayelitsha in Cape Town. It was established in 2008, and currently has a paid staff of 21 and a membership of more than 3 000. Members volunteer and register as members and are organised in branches established in different nodes of Khayelitsha.

SJC focuses on government accountability, and much of its work has focused on safety and sanitation in particular. SJC's strategy includes education of community members as well as awareness raising to garner support among the wider community. Methods used include mass media and Twitter alongside pickets and marches. Twitter has also been used to get the attention of key decision makers, and in particular Premier Helen Zille. However, SJC noted that this was of limited use as: "When one tweets Helen Zille she can retweet and do nothing." With all its methods, SJC emphasises the need to operate within the law so as to respect the rights of others while claiming one's own rights.

SJC is at the end of a funding and technical support from IBP for a social audit, which it called Imali Yethu (our money). The Heinrich Böll Foundation also supported Imali Yethu. In building on the Imali Yethu experience, SJC has recently started used MXit with cellphones for reporting on problems with toilets. Use of MXit was considered appropriate given the poverty in the community, and inaccessibility and/or expense of other available modes of reporting which require landlines, paid cellphone calls, or Internet. The project will, however, also have a Facebook element. The organisation is approaching other funders for the technology support (but was not aware of MAVC despite having funding support from HIVOS).

SJC and NU are developing the MXit application with assistance from Cell-Life, but are also receiving assistance from Code4SA. The approach used is similar to that used in Lungisa, but SJC's adaptation will focus on water, sanitation and drains and citizen reports will be handled by SJC rather than by Cell-Life. The MXit dummy is currently in English, but SJC generally translates all its material into Xhosa although social networking is done in English. As with Cell-Life's Lungisa, individuals will be able to report service delivery problems. In addition, SJC's community auditors (from the social audit) will monitor sites on a regular monthly basis. NU will support the initiative through training of the auditors and training and hosting of the person who will receive the reports and work with the City on ensuring problems are addressed. SJC and NU will also use the data collected for advocacy and education.

In 2011 SJC used MXit for a survey in which Khayelitsha residents were asked to rate the importance of ten issues. Approximately 10 000 people responded.

South African History Archive

South African History Archive (SAHA) is recognised, alongside ODAC, as an organisation with expertise in relation to PAIA requests. SAHA's core mission is to collect "lost and neglected histories" as well as record "history in the making". Its activities are organised around two programmes, one of which is the Freedom of Information Programme. The organisation aims not only to collect and record history, but also to disseminate it in innovative ways. It offers capacity building on PAIA through workshops, shadow mentoring, establishment of networks, and assistance at organisational level.

South African Regional Poverty Network

The web-site of this network states that that it is "undergoing a strategic reorientation following a decision by its Board to redefine its status and focus as an independent NGO."

Upstart Youth

This Grahamstown-based organisation has a newspaper, film project and regular live radio show every Saturday in term time. The media are produced by high school learners (aged 13-19 years) for their peers. The youth are encouraged to report both positive and negative stories.

Upstart has attempted to engage with government and public agencies such as Bhisho True FM, but has had limited success. While government representatives speak highly of the project on public platforms, the project has struggled to get a response or recognition from government beyond this.

Innovative Communication and Information Technology Initiatives

This section of the report provides information about organisations, individuals, institutions and companies that could be important from a technological innovation within the MAVC scope. In several cases it was not clear in which section particular organisations should fall. Cell-Life, for example, is listed in the previous section but could as easily fit here. Similarly, some of the research institutions listed in the later section could fit well in this section.

The terms of reference suggested that this section should also include a listing of women working in technology organisations and initiatives. That seemed inappropriate in the South African context given the relatively large number of women active in this field and the fact that many of those interviewed were women without any special request for women interlocutors having been made.

African Media Initiative

Several informants referred to the role of [Justin Arenstein](#), who is a former investigative journalist currently consulting for Google, the Knight Foundation (KF) and Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation (BMGF) through the International Center for Journalism (ICFJ), in Washington DC. ICFJ has, on behalf of KF and BMGF, seconded Arenstein to serve as the chief strategist at the African Media Initiative (AMI). AMI is a Kenyan-based continental association of c-level media executives (CEOs, COOs, CTOs, etc), publishers and owners of 800+ media companies on the continent and receives funding from both traditional funders plus newer technology-focused organisations. Arenstein runs the digital innovation programme at AMI and describes his mandate as to assist media and social justice NGOs to "leapfrog the disruption caused by the migration of audiences and revenue into the digital space".

AMI's digital programme tries to achieve its goals by serving as a catalyst for the development of 'backbone digital infrastructure' that would be too big for ordinary actors to tackle, as well as through incubation of 'hacktivist' networks, prototype experimentation, technical support for early adopters, and a major focus on improving 'grassroots engagement'. A major AMI focus is on re-use and/or scaling of successful technologies, including customization or localization where necessary. AMI networks include the [Code for Africa](#) open data movement, the [Hacks/Hackers](#) data journalism movement, the Ujuzi Digital Skills programme and the ANCIR investigative journalism network. AMI also funds and manages the $1m/year [African News Innovation Challenge](#) to build 'citizen technologies', as well as the $1m/year [African Story Challenge](#) to pilot engagement-driven narrative models, and the Code for Africa Sandbox Fund for smaller and higher-risk prototype grants. These initiatives have helped seed, promote or otherwise support South African volunteer-run hacktivist networks (Hacks/Hackers chapters in Johannesburg and Cape Town, plus ODADI and support for the Open Knowledge Foundation's embryonic local chapter), along with a range of open data projects (establishing Code4SA and augmenting PMG's work and creating the ListeningPost citizen reporting app and askAFRICA all in Cape Town, plus AfricaCheck and sourceAFRICA and Churnalism in Johannesburg, Oxpeckers and Ziwaphi in Mpumalanga, Impreshin in Limpopo and roughly 10 other projects elsewhere in South Africa). Arenstein's programme also supports technology hubs/labs (CitizenLab in Johannesburg and Codebridge in Cape Town), and helps develop resources or MOOCs or skills programmes for digital training institutions. AMI's institutional partners include major South Africa media such as City Press, Mail & Guardian, Daily Maverick, Business Day, Daily Sun, and the national news agency, Sapa, as well as the umbrella Print & Digital Media South Africa (PDMSA) industry association and its grassroots counterpart at the Association of Independent Publishers (AIP). AMI helps these media with technical skills and on-site digital experimentation, and also helps take their thought-leaders to international events to learn from global trends. AMI has further strategic partnerships with the local arms of NGO / donors that include the Praekelt Foundation, Indigo Trust, Google, the local Open Society Foundation, the World Wide Web Foundation, Mo Ibrahim Foundation, CorruptionWatch, Institute for Security Studies, Parliamentary Monitoring Group, ODAC, SAFLII, Stats SA, etc. AMI has also just partnered with the Open Knowledge Foundation – and is in the process of partnering with the local arm of International Budget Partnership – on an AfricanSpending portal that Arenstein envisages will provide public access to detailed budget information in

machine-readable and comparable formats to allow for easy analysis and 3rd party reuse. This echoes other work that AMI supports to codify and digitize public information, such as OpenByLaw.org.za and the Churnalism projects. OKF is in the process of building the AfricanSpending portal, with the South African site currently containing little apart from a large "coming soon" notice. AMI has also contracted OKF to upgrade the openAFRICA.net open data portal, which is a volunteer initiative underwritten by AMI and the World Bank Institute and Google. In early December 2013, the initiative's website provided access roughly 1,000 datasets with 37 South African datasets that had been 'liberated' from public organisations that ordinarily refuse digital access. These two portals will compliment the InvestigativeDashboard.org and sourceAFRICA.net projects that AMI funds, with local forensic research teams supporting South African (and wider African) media and social justice organizations.

The ANCIR investigative journalism network serves as an "early adopter" end-user for much of the technology that is being built, to provide proof-of-concept for even wider adoption. ANCIR currently consists of 14 top-level member newsrooms across Africa, that include eight South African newsrooms.

Arenstein is outspokenly critical of "data porn" (incident reporting and data visualization) and sees his AMI programme as building a self-sustaining "ecosystem" of end-users, with open data as "feedstock" and modular open technologies to drive mass adoption, rather than being a traditional funder that invests into one-off projects or NGOs. He stresses that AMI focuses on supporting the "demand side" of digital innovation (by surfacing and prioritizing real citizen needs articulated by real communities and then helping "mass mobilizers" like the media and grassroots NGOs to develop solutions), rather than focusing on the "supply side" of digital innovation where techies or governments / data-owners or NGOs themselves set the priorities. An important part of the AMI strategy is to lower the cost for digital solutions, by breaking the stranglehold that consultants and commercial suppliers have, by promoting re-use of proven technologies where appropriate, and by creating a network of non-profit "citizen labs" supported by hacktivists and other volunteer tech networks that focus on re-use and scaling proven technologies.

Ahmed Kajee and DG Murray Trust

Ahmed Kajee is the consultant who is assisting the DG Murray Trust in its work to explore options for reducing the costs to users of mobile data, in particular in respect of access to health, education, social services and employment. At the time this research was conducted, Kajee was completing research exploring impediments to development and use of ICT platforms. He was also compiling a list of mobile services relating to socio-economic development.

Daily Maverick

The Daily Maverick is a daily on-line "newspaper" that combines news, information, analysis and opinion. There are no subscription fees, with advertising serving as the only source of

funding. The initiative is independently owned and has no affiliation to any other media group, or any political party or religious organisation.

Heinrich Böll Foundation

The Heinrich Böll Foundation organised a meeting in 2013 to connect feminists – particularly young ones – working on social media. The aim was to promote collaboration and information sharing rather than engagement with government.

Info4Africa

Info4Africa is a self-funded centre of the School of Applied Human Sciences at the University of KwaZulu-Natal. It was previously the Centre for HIV/AIDS Networking and the HIV-911 Programme, and in this guise developedt a country-wide database of over 12 000 providers of support services.

Info4Africa's first use of mobile was to allow users to have access to the database through their mobiles. The organisation developed a tool that allowed users to search 24 hours a day on what facilities were available in their area. The tool is based on USSD which means that, while it is "clunky", it is available on all sorts of phones. It uses menus, and thus requires minimal typing. The first menu asks users to choose from four languages. While Info4Africa has not investigated language use in depth, its perception is that users often try an African language, find that the wording is cumbersome, and then revert to "the language of forms" (English). All the cell networks except Vodacom have agreed to zero-rate calls; Vodacom users must pay 60 cents per call.

Info4Africa was the technology provider for Black Sash's pilot of using cellphones for their CMAP initiative. Subsequent to the pilot, Info4Africa developed a feedback element for its database service. Users are prompted to answer five questions on the chosen facility. The responses can be emailed to the clinic sister. At the time of the interview Info4Africa was piloting this feedback service but had not secured budget to take it forward.

Info4Africa receives technical assistance from Always Active Technologies, which is said to have solid experience working with USSD. Info4Africa has funded the work on its mobile project through donations and corporate support.

Internet Society – South Africa chapter

The Internet Society is a non-profit international organisation that has chapters in close on 100 countries, including one in South Africa. Its overall aim is to ensure that the Internet is developed in a stable and open manner. Membership is open to individuals. The South African chapter has more than 800 members and is particularly concerned with addressing the digital divide. Areas of activity are education, policy, communication and outreach. The policy leg includes making submissions in respect of all Internet-related policy, and following the passage of legislation through parliament.

Keystone

Keystone operates internationally and has done work in 30 countries, but the company was born in South Africa and has offices in South Africa, the United Kingdom and the United States. To date it has worked primarily with foundations, but it is currently supporting the DPME's initiative on accountability and citizen monitoring. Its approach, which has "making all voices count" (whether in the ears of funders or, more recently, the ears of government) at its core, draws on both participatory development techniques from the development arena and customer satisfaction approaches from business. It has combined ideas from both to develop its approach to "constituent voice".

Keystone's Andre Proctor contrasts their "management mindset" approach with the "social science" approach of academics and other research. One element in this contrast is the management focus on a small number of questions and less complicated responses than are common in academic research. This approach facilitates the use of simple phones with USSD drop-down menus.

Keystone's Andre Proctor also contrasts their approach to the crowdsourcing/polling information initiatives done by Ushahidi in East Africa, where responses are aggregated and shown on a map. Keystone places emphasis on what is done with the data after it is collected so that it can inform implementation. In this approach citizens' voices should not only be heard, but also be able to influence what is done.

Keystone hopes that it can utilise, in South Africa, the approach that will be developed with a large grant of US$ 200 000 recently received from the Hewlett Foundation for work with the Children and Families Alliance in the United States. The aim is to build a "feedback commons" that will be used by all the charities that are members of the alliance.

mLab Southern Africa

mLab Southern Africa is one of five mLabs established by the World Bank and Finnish government. The mLab based in South Africa serves Southern Africa and another based in Kenya serves East Africa. The five mLabs function independently of each other but have the same mandate, namely to drive innovation in mobiles so as to create new jobs. Currently mLab is based in Gauteng, but it will soon also be operating from the Bandwidth Barn in Cape Town.

The Gauteng provincial government's Innovation Hub partners with mLab in respect of its annual innovation competition. Once the province has selected the winning proposals, mLab incubates the ideas. Two previous winners of the competition, while not directly relevant for MAVC, involve use of mobile technology in areas that are of direct interest to government.

The first one, the Afta Robot application, tracks kombi taxis and commuters and allows them to engage with each other. It is currently being piloted in four areas in Gauteng. The second one, Go Metro, was developed and piloted and was subsequently adopted by the Passenger Rail Agency of South Africa. It allows the agency and Metrorail to engage directly with

commuters, for example about timetables. It includes a job link for non-professional jobs. It is app-based so imposes a data cost on commuters, but the cost is less than for SMS.

The three winning proposals selected in January 2013 and currently under development will allow for engagement of municipal councils and citizens on issues of policy and public safety.

Mobilitate

Mobilitate is a social media platform that allows users to report on service delivery problems at local level, mobilise supporters and "lobby" the relevant authorities. The Mobilitate site was created in 2010 and is funded by Kaiziania, a Pretoria-based company. The site covers six broad areas. "Service delivery" focuses on municipal problems such as potholes and broken streetlights; "communities" allows neighbourhoods and communities to discuss local issues; "councilors" facilitates interaction with the ward councillor; "crimespotter" allows users to register to receive free SMS crime alerts and report criminal incidents; "causes" allows users to "create" a cause and generate support for it; while "news" allows users to post news stories. Citizen users are not charged for use of the service. The system uses Googlemaps to map the location of problems reported.

After three months of operation the site had more than 3 500 members who had reported 1 156 problems, 210 of which had been resolved. Already at that point some municipalities had established a relationship with the service and had tasked officials to attend to issues that came up. Kaiziania did not respond to a request for further information, but another respondent indicated that the City of Cape Town used Mobilitate as one of its ways of hearing citizens' voices.

Non-Profit Network

The Non-Profit Network was established as an NGO by Ruendree Govender based on her experience in doing consultancies for NGOs on use of social media. Govender came to the conclusion that training and mentoring were ineffective on their own, and that a network would allow for profiling of organisations that were making good use of social media.

Govender obtained funding from the Open Society Foundation and produced a guide to use of social media which both explains the different types of media and gives concrete examples of how South African organisations have used them. She has submitted applications to Open Society for funding for further work.

In Govender's view, of the organisations profiled in the guide it is only Equal Education that has done effective work that falls within the MAVC scope. In particular, she singled out Equal Education's use of a youtube video as part of their multi-pronged campaign to force the Minister of Education to issue norms and standards for school infrastructure. Govender's guide suggests that an organisations needs to devote substantial time if they want to use social media effectively, with an estimated 5-10 hours per week needed for Facebook, 10-15

hours for Twitter, 2-5 hours for YouTube, 5-10 hours for LinkeIn, 3-10 hours for pinterest and 4-6 hours for blogging.

Praekelt Foundation

The Praekelt Foundation is an international non-profit that provides non-financial support to technology-related projects. Its main Southern African office is in Johannesburg with the technical team based in Cape Town.

The foundation has several projects – mostly still unfunded – in the democracy area, which is one of five focus areas. These include a proposal submitted to MAVC together with Lawyers for Human Rights on refugee rights. The idea is to use a mobile tool to provide information to people applying for refugee status on where to go, which documents they need, and what to do at each stop of the process. The application would be designed for USSD with basic menus and SMS would be used to send messages to the refugees.

Another project proposal, which was refused funding by the Swedish International Development Cooperation, was developed together with Corruption Watch. The proposal was for the establishment of a mobile social network (using feature phones) on which users could report corruption and Corruption Watch could communicate with different constituencies. The foundation used its experiencing with the large Young Africa Live project, which focuses on issues such as love, sex and health, in developing the proposal. (Young Africa Live reaches close on two million users, but focuses on education and entertainment and thus does not qualify as "citizen voice".)

The foundation is also talking to Good Governance Africa, a spinoff of the South African Institute of Race Relations, about a project on incentivised learning, but it is not clear that this would fit into the MAVC scope.

The first of Praekelt's two current "live" project in the democracy area is mDem. The foundation has developed a mobi – a website that can be accessed by mobiles – for opposition parties. The project, which is funded by the Konrad Adenauer Foundation, seeks to address the perceived problem that opposition parties have less access to formal media than the ruling party. South Africa is one of several countries in which the approach is being tested. In South Africa, Praekelt Foundation is working with the Democratic Alliance. Use of the mobi requires a feature phone.

The second 'live' digital democracy project is the partnership with AMI and Code4SA to run a CitizenLab for governance and accountability projects in Johannesburg. The CitizenLab is housed inside Praekelt's jozihub.org technology innovation center, and offers support to four digital democracy projects at any time, including free workspace with broadband web access, meeting and office facilities, access to expert mentors, and access to a wider community of technology entrepreneurs. The CitizenLab is run by a full-time coordinator (who is co-managed by Code4SA and Praekelt), who helps resident projects find resources / experts, as well as helps them tap into the local Hacks/Hackers community (Hacks/Hackers Jozi runs out of Jozihub). The CitizenLab will also run up to four Code4Democracy hackathons in 2014, as

catalyst events for surfacing new ideas, pioneers, and partnerships. The CitizenLab is co-funded by AMI and Indigo Trust.

The rest of the Jozihub tech space is used by young commercial entrepreneurs who are building tech-driven start-ups. The synergies between civil society focused initiatives and commercial projects is expected to kickstart a social entrepreneur culture. Jozihub also runs a meet-up venue, that is home to organisations like Hacks/Hackers, and is also regularly used by AMI, Google, and others for digital democracy workshops or meetings.

RLabs

RLabs was one of the initiatives that other informants referred to most often, generally naming it alongside Jozihub in Johannesburg as an important technology hub. RLabs' founder and leader, Marlon Parker, describes it as a community-driven movement to give people the power to act and the knowledge about the power of the Internet so that they can come up with creative solutions for communities and turn some of them into enterprises. The focus is on youth aged 18-25 years.

The website describes its core activities as "skills and training, community development, social and disruptive innovation, mobile and Internet solutions, social enterprise incubation, impact investing and social franchising". The organisation operates in Bridgetown and Atlantis in Cape Town as well as in Johannesburg and 21 other countries. It will start operating in Mitchells Plain and Khayelitsha in Cape Town in January 2014.

The organisation has about 70 staff in Cape Town and 3-4 in Johannesburg. Approximately 40% of its revenue comes from donors, which include USAID, the Finnish government, DFID and Indigo Foundation. Approximately 60% of revenue is obtained through consulting fees.

RLabs' Migox project is the one that seems closest to the MAVC focus. The project utilised MXit to allow people to share blog-like stories. More than 40 000 people participated in some way. Rlabs produced mini reports on the various issues and fed them into relevant government departments. The majority of the responses were seen as falling within the scope of the Department of Social Development.

RLabs also organised an "unconference" which was physically attended by more than 2 500 people in the RLabs office and reached 30 000 further individuals through other platforms. The inputs received through this event were developed into a report that informed the Department of Social Development's youth development strategy for the province.

RLabs is currently working on a project with the DG Murray Trust mapping the provision of services by "social organisations" in the Western Cape. The project will create Internet mapping tools for government while providing information on people's needs for DG Murray Trust and Rlabs.

A young person from Blikkiesdorp who received training from the RLabs academy subsequently approached Parker to provide assistance in developing a mobile app for community members to send photos showing problems to government to obtain a response rather than having to resort to protests. The idea is that the photo "cases" would remain open and visible until government had taken action to address the problem.

SAP

SAP is a global technology software company that has region-specific market units. It has offices in Cape Town, Durban and Johannesburg in South Africa and its customers include many of the metros as well as other municipalities. Customers include Cape Town, Johannesburg, Tshwane, Nelson Mandela Bay, Capricorn District and Mogale City among others. Within SAP, there is a project called Urban Matters which aims to assist customers "make cities run better". SAP has devised ways in which a two-way channel can be built into its Enterprise Resource Planning so as to allow for interaction with citizen (and business) users of services.

The City of Cape Town is probably the most advanced of SAP's South African customers in terms of communication with users. The Chief Information Officer is committed to the use of Internet and call centres. Existing initiatives include annual satisfaction surveys commissioned from an independent market research company and a webpage that allows logging of service requests. The City uses Twitter, among other purposes, to send out daily announcements of the exact planned location of electricity maintenance. There are also plans to roll out what SAPS refers as "mobility", i.e. phone-based apps that will work on feature and smartphones.

Among SAPS' customers further north, the social development department within the City of Johannesburg uses SMS to communicate with the beneficiaries of their social assistance package as well as with NGOs who provide assistance to the beneficiaries. Referrals are done primarily through SMS. The IT department within the Gauteng Treasury has plans for cellphone apps that will target tourists.

SeeSaw

SeeSaw is a global social enterprise that provides software advice and training in the areas of technology use for water and sanitation management. Clients include municipalities, water companies and national regulators. One of SeeSaw's co-founders, David Schaub Jones, is South African and based in the country. SeeSaw wlll coordinate the South African leg of a 10-city Sanitation Hackathon to be held on 1-2 December 2014 with support from the World Bank, Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation, and Random Hacks of Kindness among others. SeeSaw has developed a water service map for project planning and a 'FixMyStreet' app for citizen reporting of water problems and red tape challenges.

Vereeniging van Nederlands Gemeente International [VNG-I]

The Vereeniging van Nederlands Gemeente International (VNG-I) is a technical partner of the MAVC initiative and has staff based in South Africa. VNG itself is a membership organisation that brings together local governments in the Netherlands, and is thus similar to the South African Local Government Association (SALGA) in South Africa. VNG International is a "daughter" organisation that provides support in other countries as a form of development cooperation. VNG has been in South Africa for 10-15 years and its funding comes primarily from the Ministry of Foreign Affairs or the Dutch Embassy. To date VNG has not had or supported projects relevant to MAVC in South Africa. In other countries it has supported projects on citizen engagement and some that use technology, but not necessarily projects that bring together these two elements.

Web Foundation

The World Wide Web Foundation was established in 2009 by inventor of the web, Sir Tim Berners-Lee, with the aim or realizing his vision of an "open Web available, usable, and valuable for everyone." The foundation is reliant on donations and partnerships. One of its three offices is in Cape Town.

AMI has funded WWWF to spearhead the Code4Ghana initiative in West Africa. Code4Ghana, and similar initiatives in Kenya and Nigeria, are similar in focus and implementation to Code4SA.

Research landscape

This section aims to identify and map key research institutes, think tanks, researchers or NGOs with in-house research capacity in the fields of citizen engagement and voice, accountability, responsiveness and technology. Again, it was sometimes difficult to identify what should and should not be in this section. Firstly, there was the challenge of whether to place action-research initiatives here or under the earlier section on non-governmental initiatives. Secondly, there were several initiatives that qualify more strongly as teaching than research although those involved might write up their experiences as academic papers. Some of those who are exploring and promoting use of technology in teaching come together in a project on the use of emerging technologies to improve teaching and learning at higher education institutions funded by the National Research Foundation and headed by Viv Bozalek at the University of Western Cape. These initiatives are not covered in this report apart from research at Rhodes University that seems to incorporate an element of citizen voices. Thirdly, there was at least one initiative – in respect of ornithology – where the aim was to encourage ordinary citizens to become researchers, perhaps using some forms of technology but without a link with government. Again, this is not included in this report.

Council for Scientific and Industrial Research

Several informants named the Centre for Scientific and Industrial Research as an agency the worked on technology and innovation issues. This included work with for the Department of Communications in respect of broadband policy.

The Council's Meraka Institute was named in particular. The SALGA-GIZ research identified Meraka's Infopreneur project as the longest-running programme involving use of ICT through an intermediary. The original aim was to assist small and larger businesses to work together across the urban-rural divide. The initiative does not seem directly relevant for our purposes.

Vushe et al (2011) describe the Digital Doorway initiative on which Meraka collaborates with the Department of Science and Technology. Digital Doorway, launched in 2002, aims to help bridge the "digital divide" by helping people get comfortable with technology. Each of the more than 2000 Digital Doorway installations has a computer system that citizens can use for self-learning. The computer is not an Internet terminal and this initiative thus also seems of limited relevance to MAVC.

Human Science Research Council

The Human Sciences Research Council (HSRC) has several researchers who have worked or are working on topics that have some relation to MAVC's area of interest, although little that as yet directly addresses the core of MAVC.

Elme Vivier works on a project funded by National Treasury, the City Support Programme. The HSRC is looking at citizen engagement, corruption, and environmental issues. The focus includes how cities use ICT, but this aspect has "taken a back seat". The research is still at the scoping stage and is planned to end in March 2014. Piloting will be done in one (as yet unchosen) metro. One of the ideas is to include a social audit-like element and feedback through SMS.

Narnia Bohler-Muller recently presented a paper at the World Social Science Forum in Montreal on "Enhancing Digital Citizen Engagement: Some lessons from South Africa". The paper profiled Mobilitate, the SALGA-GIZ project and the Rural Bafokeng Nation. To date this research has been desk- and Internet-based, without direct engagement with individuals involved in the three initiatives.

Peter Jacobs oversees two projects that might be partially relevant for MAVC. The Rural Innovation Assessment Toolbox involves mapping of rural innovation activities in 24 rural district municipalities for the Department of Science and Technologies. The finding to date is that there is very limited knowledge of usage of ICT devices such as mobile phones and Internet. The Youth Driven Development project, which was implemented in 2012, used social media platforms – Facebook in particular – to dialogue with unemployed graduates on current development challenges and alternatives. A group of interns implemented the project under the leadership of Stewart Ngandu.

Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University

Derek Taylor in political and government studies is collaborating with the University of Cape Town's Ulrike Rivett in the study of cellphone use for monitoring of water quality in rural areas described below.

Research ICT Africa

Research ICT Africa is a network that researches ICT policy and regulation and, in particular, how ICT can be used to promote social development and economic growth. Alison Gillwald, in particular, was named by several informants as a key expert and researcher in this field.

Rhodes University

Alette Schoon works with her journalism students to train young people in Grahamstown to produce mobile phone videos as a form of citizen's journalism. She does this through several routes. Firstly, she worked on a project of the local Grocott's Mail in which young and unemployed people learnt how to produce videos that were posted on the newspaper website and packaged in a talkshow that was circulated via DVD in the community. Secondly, her students assisted learners in Upstart to make videos that were circulated on Youtube and via Bluetooth on mobile phones. In at least one cases the videos stimulated a community discussion in which the local councillor was involved about how having to fetch water was interfering with going to school. Thirdly, her students produced training videos for a television company that was interested in mobile phone citizen journalism on how to make videos on your mobile phone. Fourth, Schoon and colleague Lorenza Dalvit were – at the time of the interview – writing a paper looking at the use videos of police violence as a form of citizen journalism that had been used effectively by the Daily Sun. These videos, which the Sun's video editor, Thabiso Sekhula, calls "action videos", are sent in by readers, generally using WhatsApp.

Schoon is currently working on a PhD that explores this type of action-teaching.

AMI's partner, the Knight Foundation, has previously funded an $700,000 citizen reporting and mobile-based citizen engagement project at Rhodes' Journalism School. The Indaba Ziyafika project entailed a volunteer newsroom, a mobile news app for feature phones, and experiments at stimulating public participation in municipal governance. The mobile app, NIKA, failed both a code audit and independent field tests in Ghana conducted by AMI and has not been redeployed outside of Rhodes' journalism programme.

South African Data Archive

The South African Data Archive (SADA) was established in 1993 under the auspices of the Human Sciences Research Council (HSRC) but is currently managed by the National Research Foundation. It is the only government-funded data archive in Africa. The archive curates and makes available microdata from surveys. Its data portal lists 167 studies, 53 of which are from the HSRC (all pre-2003) while 67 are from Statistics South Africa. Researchers complete an online form and receive the data on disk by post or via an FTP

server. Unlike DataFirst, SADA does not provide an online help service and does not assess data quality.

South African Institute of International Affairs

The South African Institute of International Affairs hosts a programme on the African Peer Review Mechanism and governance in Africa more generally. Steven Gruzd heads this programme. He has not to date done research directly relevant to MAVC.

SAP

SAP's Manti Grobler recently completed her MA through the University of Pretoria on the topic of use of mobile phone by women in a rural community of Limpopo. The research work was done through a strong woman community leader rather than local government, but the women engaged with reportedly emphasised the need for government to "hear" them. Grobler plans to commence with doctoral studies in 2014 to investigate these issues further.

University of Cape Town

Ulrike Rivett heads the Information for Community Oriented Municipal Services (iComms) research team. The team is currently collaborating in a project entitled "Incentivising community engagement in Drinking Water Supply Monitoring" which will explore the use of cellphones to monitor water quality. The two-year project is being implemented in three local municipalities (as yet unchosen) in the Cacadu District in the Eastern Cape and builds on work that the group has done elsewhere, including outside the country. The project is funded by the Water Research Commission and brings together researchers across disciplines (information systems alongside civil engineering) and academic institutions (in that it includes researchers from Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University).

Community members will be provided with a cellphone application to use for reporting water supply problems or failure. There will be no cost to the user in reporting faults. Reported faults will be sent to the relevant department in the municipality and those reporting will receive a feedback message acknowledging receipt of the report and specifying how and when the municipality will respond to the problem. The six-month pilot will also test the use of various incentives to see how they may influence reporting. It will also test ease of use through experimenting with methods (SMS, USSD, MMS, voice call, missed call, app, MXit, SNS, etc.) and modality (anonymous, using community contact person, direct to government/ use of intermediary, language, text/numberic/visual/menu/QR barcode, feedback, etc.).

Cacadu District was selected both because of its openness to the project and because of the serious water supply challenges that exist in the district.

Gary Marsden is a professor in the Computer Science Department at the University of Cape Town. Each year his students develop a diverse range of interesting and useful products. However, none at present seems to relate directly to MAVC.

University of KwaZulu-Natal

Kathleen Diga and Heidi Atwood within the School of Development Studies work on ICT and development. They have not to date done work directly relevant to the MAVC focus.

World Wide Worx

World Wide Worx is probably South Africa's most well-known technology research and strategy organisation, with a focus on technology in business strategy. The organisation's Arthur Goldstuck, in particular, is well-known for his knowledge of this area.

Government initiatives and approaches that engage citizens

This section of the report is meant to identify public officials and government agencies at the forefront of advancing work in promoting citizen engagement, in particular through use of technology. The SALGA-GIZ study of 2011 emphasised the importance of distinguishing between e-government (the use of ICT use by government to enhance efficiency) and, and e-governance (use of ICT for interactions between government and civil society). The study found several good examples of e-government, but less of e-governance (Hollands, 2013). Hollands (2013) records examples of government agencies and NGOs using mobile and Internet technology for education and awareness-raising about various government services and desired behaviours. However, education and awareness-raising do not equate to facilitating the hearing of citizen voice.

Cacadu District

Cacadu District was named as a local government that was receptive to relevant initiatives by two different projects, namely the research headed by iCOMMS at the University of Cape Town into community monitoring of water quality and the planned work of PCRD on audit committees. One researcher suggested that the district has had less research done in it in the past than many other poor districts because the term "rural" is generally understood to refer to homeland areas and Makana was not part of a former homeland.

Centre for Public Service Innovation

The Centre for Public Service Innovation (CPSI) was established in 2001 as a section 21 company that reports to the Minister of Public Service and Administration. CPSI was established in response to the Public Service Act's placement of responsibility for innovation to promote effectiveness and efficiency in service delivery to the public. The Centre makes annual awards to government agencies in respect of innovative activities. One of the categories in which awards are made is innovative use of ICTs for effective service delivery

City of Cape Town

The City of Cape Town was mentioned repeatedly in interviews. This in part reflects the fact that many of the initiatives, organisations and individuals are based in Cape Town. However, it also seems that the City has gone further in its use of ICT than most other municipalities and metros, and is also on the lookout for new possibilities. It is, however, not clear whether there is a coordinated ICT strategy. Further, one informant said that when they tried to follow up on claims that the City was planning to provide free broadband to Khayelitsha and Mitchells Plain, they were told that these plans were still at the stage of a feasibility study. Another informant said that the City had fibre laid throughout but had delayed for about four years in making this available for public use.

SAP deals with the chief information officer, while the Customer Relations Department manages the City Manager's mailbox and the Mobilitate Website. The department reads, redirects, logs and follows up on all complaints and queries which appear in those inboxes.

Department for Performance Monitoring and Evaluation

The Department for Performance Monitoring and Evaluation (DPME) is in the early stages of piloting a citizen/user-based monitoring system that will complement the existing systems in which government monitors its own performance, namely progress reporting against the delivery agreements, the Management Performance Assessment Tool, and frontline services delivery monitoring.

The framework for citizen-based monitoring has been approved by the Cabinet. The framework states that all departments involved in service delivery to the public must include mechanisms for incorporating the views and experiences of citizens in their approach to monitoring and evaluation. The document notes that citizen involvement is required by section 195(1)(e) of the Constitution which states that people's needs must be responded to and (f) which states that public administration must be accountable.

DPME will pilot a new system in facilities of four agencies – the South Africa Police Service, South African Social Security Agency (SASSA) and the Departments of Health and Social Development. These agencies volunteered to be part of the system. DPME is working with Keystone in designing the system and with Seriti Institute in implementation. Seriti's role in implementation of the Community Works Programme (CWP) was a deciding factor in their selection. The CWP forms part of the government's Expanded Public Works Programme but, in contrast to other parts of the programme, provides for each community to decide what work is needed, and also provides a basic employment guarantee in the form of two days of work per beneficiary household. DPME hopes to utilise the CWP structures and workers (or "volunteers" in DPME terminology) in districts where it operates so as to avoid the participating agencies having to pay monitors.

The piloting (or "prototyping") has started in two ex-"homeland" sites, Phutaditjhaba in Free State and Msinga in KwaZulu-Natal. Further sites will be added in three stages until there are 13 pilot sites by mid-2014. Not all of these sites have CWP at present.

The first stage of the pilot in each site will be used for community discussions to inform the questions to be asked. The monitoring will use very simple and short questionnaires of about five closed-end questions each. Over time, DPME hopes that these ground-level "perception of performance" indicators can be used to develop generic higher-level performance indicators that cut across agencies and districts. The first cycle survey is planned for January and will probably utilise cellphones. The data captured at ground-level will be fed into a database that will be analysable through specially designed web-based software.

The citizen-based monitoring is being driven by a small newly-established directorate within DPME. Three posts are provided for currently in the directorate. Over time, the department hopes to expand to other forms of monitoring. This could include monitoring of service-level agreements with private service providers using a social audit-type approach.

Department of Public Service and Administration

The Department of Public Service and Administration is the lead department in South Africa for the Open Government Programme. It also houses the Anti-Corruption Forum and the CPSI.

Gauteng provincial government

The Innovation Hub of the Gauteng Department of Economic Development partners with mLab in respect of its annual innovation competition.

Government Communication and Information Service

The Thusong Service Centres are intended as one-stop centres that provide both information and services to communities, providing access to services from multiple government agencies in one place. Vushe et al (2011) quote a Public Service Commission report which notes that lack of ICTs – in particular computers and telephones – severely constrains service delivery at the Thusong centres. As at end March 2012, 171 Thusong Service Centres were in operation. The services offered and government agencies present differ across centres. The centres do not seem directly relevant to MAVC.

KwaZulu-Natal provincial government

The KwaZulu-Natal province's Operation Sukuma Sakhe was suggested as a possible government initiative of interest to MAVC. The web-site states that this initiative "is a continuous interaction between Government and the community to come together to achieve the 12 National Outcomes. We will encourage social mobilization where communities have a role, as well as delivery of government services in a more integrated way…" There was no response to efforts to find out more about the initiative.

National Anti-Corruption Forum

This forum brings together civil society, government and business. It was launched in June 2001, just over two years after the National Anti-Corruption Summit resolution that such a

forum be established. Each sector is represented by ten members nominated by their respective constituencies. Business is represented by Business Unity South Africa but the work is coordinated by Business Against Crime. Civil society is represented by ten organisations.

The Forum itself is located within the Public Service Commission and the government delegation is led by the Minister of Public Service and Administration, Lindiwe Sisulu. Four Pretoria-based Commission staff persons act as the secretariat for the forum, but do so in addition to other tasks as an "ad hoc" function. The forum does not use Internet and mobiles. Its (old-fashioned) website is out of date, including in terms of who is named as chairperson of the forum, and the names of several of the government agencies. The current chairperson is Zwelinzima Vavi. The Black Sash person named as the most active civil society participant no longer works for Black Sash.

National Planning Commission

The National Planning Commission is based in the Presidency. Addendum A of the National Development Plan drawn up by the commission describes efforts to involve ordinary citizens – and youth in particular – in the development process of the plan.

The strategies included use of electronic media such as an online "Jam", Facebook, Twitter, MXit, and YouTube. The Commission created a Facebook page and set up a Twitter account. These were used both to keep people informed and for input. Three was also a specific Facebook dialogue on the theme of nation building. For youth, the commission organised two live chats using MXit. It also collaborated with IBM to host a 72-hour online discussion, known as the Jam.

The Jam was launched at the University of Johannesburg. Given limited public access to Internet, the commission asked the National Youth Development Agency and NGO LoveLife to make their ICT infrastructure available. More than 10 300 logins and 8 700 individual posts were recorded during the Jam, with 38% of the posts from youth under 30 years of age.

The Jam provided for ten parallel discussion forums on the nine challenges identified in the commission's diagnostic document. The most popular forums were education and training, the economy and jobs. Addendum A includes word maps that shows the relative frequency of different topics, but it is not clear to what extent the input was taken further in the actual drafting of the national development plan.

National Treasury

The National Treasury makes a fairly full set of budget-related documents for both the national and provincial spheres available on its website. The documents are downloadable as pdf documents but the National Treasury also provides Excel versions of all tables for the key national budget books.

Reducing Maternal and Child Mortality through strengthening primary health care

The Reducing Maternal and Child Mortality initiative is a three-year programme (2012-2015) funded by DFID and implemented by a partnership of The Futures Group, Health Systems Trust, Save the Children UK and Social Development Direct. The main aim of the programme is to support the national Department of Health. Social Development Direct is specifically responsible for the demand and accountability component, which involves a grant-making facility for civil society organisations to support development and testing of innovative approaches to demand and accountability at the district level.

Social Development Direct has had conversations with Keystone (and perhaps others) about the possibility of using technology but currently has no concrete plans in that respect.

Royal Bafokeng Nation

The Royal Bafokeng Nation is a traditional authority in the North West province. Traditional authorities are not a core part of government but chapter 12 of the 1996 Constitution recognises the institution of traditional leadership. The exact extent of their authority and role has been at issue in relation, among others, to the Traditional Courts Bill and the Communal Land Rights Act which was overturned by the Constitutional Court. The Royal Bafokeng Nation's use of technology is interesting because such authorities operate primarily in rural areas.

This particular traditional authority has reportedly used mobile technology and social media extensively to communicate with community members (Bohler-Muller, 2013). These activities are driven by the authority's research and knowledge management department. Facebook, Twitter and bulk SMS have been used to notify community members about events and to raise awareness around issues such as intellectual disability. The authority has plans to use ICT more interactively to resolve service delivery problems.

South African Human Rights Commission

The South African Human Rights Commission (SAHRC) is one of the Section 9 institutions established by the 1996 Constitution rather than part of government, but probably fits better in this section of the report than in any other.

The Rights Information Unit of the SAHRC is receiving technical assistance from Gabriella Razzano of Code4SA in its attempt to make public service data publicly available. In particular, they are hoping that the Department of Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs (COGTA) and municipalities will make independent development plans, service delivery improvement plans and other service delivery data available for posting in a single portal.

South African Local Government Association

The South African Local Government Association (SALGA) brings together all local governments in the country. SALGA houses a project, the Local Government ICT Network, which aims to build a community of practice among municipal ICT professionals. The project has current support from GIZ to promote use of technology for e-governance. The emphasis is on use of SMS because of the lack of reliable Internet connections in many parts of the country. The project has funding until mid-2014.

One of the first steps in the project was to commission research. The in-depth report, which the SALGA informant described as more theoretical than practical, is available on the SALGA web-site. The study found that web-based ICT interventions were of limited used unless facilitated by intermediaries, such as NGOs, community-based organisations or movements. Further, social media were used primarily by activist groups serving middle-class constituencies, including ratepayer associations.

The report includes useful discussion of the legal framework, including the Constitution, Promotion of Access to Information Act, Protection of Personal Information Bill, Consumer Protection Act and the Electronic Communications and Transactions Act. It includes a table that shows the different ways that ICTs have been used for formal and informal participation by citizens in local government. The table includes a column showing the relevant legislation for different types of intervention. The simplified extract below lists the items that seem most relevant for MAVC.

1. **Examples of use of ICT by municipalities to engage with citizens**

Registration of interested parties via web of email for input on spatial frameworks, land use plans, etc	Most metros and some large local municipalities
Provision for electronic input into integrated development plan e.g. email, SMS	Eden District, Nelson Mandel Metro, Cape Town
Website facility for public comments/feedback on by laws and policies	Nelson Mandel Metro (others allow for this by Twitter, Facebook (Cape Town, Tzaneen as examples)
General use of chat rooms, wikis, MXit etc to generate discussion on key topics (Schedules of e-meetings and topics for on-line discussion; minuting of forums to wiki or blog format allowing public to comment on past meetings)	Cape Town
Provision of all information required by Municipal Structures and Municipal Financial Management Acts on website with easy-to-use search	Cape Town
Email updates to registered subscribers at times of municipal crisis e.g. budget/ cash flow	Nelson Mandela Metro

On-line feedback to departments via website, sms, call centre, MSIT, email	Cape Town, Msunduzi, Eden, Nelson Mandel Metro
On-line polls on key issues e.g. renaming streets	Ethekwini
Free SMS for reporting crime or violation of by laws	Msundiziy
Register for SMS alerts of council meetings, IDP forums, etc	Knysna, Tzaneen
ICT-enabled customer satisfaction surveys – web, SMS, call cdntre	"Several"
Call centres on service issues and/or account queries	Cape Town, Eden
High-level user services such as CCTV traffic flow and water quality to website or mobile	eThekwini, Cape Town

The SALGA-GIZ report notes that South African government discourse on ICTs and governance tends to conflate e-government with e-governance. Many officials – and particularly technical ones – do not understand that use of ICT to make services is not the same as e-governance. In particular, they often do not see ICT as having a role to play in facilitating participation in decision-making, which is seen as more political.

Emakhaweni (formerly Belfast) in Mpumalanga was one of the earliest initiatives supported by the Network project and sparked off a set of pilots. The Emakhaweni IT manager collected the cellphone numbers of all employees and sent information to them about power cuts, community meetings, etc. Employees passed on the message to neighbours but also told them that they could add their names to the list. This approach of voluntary registration avoided suspicion from residents as to why they were being asked for their details. The then IT manager developed the system and trained colleagues on how to use it. The response was reportedly good, and brought direct benefits, including increased attendance at meetings and fewer protests.

SALGA then used its provincial offices to inform municipalities and ask them whether they would like to pilot similar initiatives. Some of those who volunteered subsequently dropped out because they did not have the necessary capacity, for example they did not have an IT manager. The four who remained consisted of two in Western Cape and two in Northern Cape, with a further two from the Western Cape joining the pilot more recently. The pilot municipalities are Nama Khoi, Khai Gariep, Drakenstein and Theewaterskloof. Each of these is required to prepare a project plan and get the go-ahead from their Council. Project plans must include an element that goes beyond IT and/or communication to allow residents to "see that something is happening". It is likely that the pilots will focus on a specific issue, such as potholes.

SALGA is contracting a research consultant who will compile all the information and learning obtained through the pilots, including technical and other problems. This information will be used to develop factsheets that will make up a practical toolkit.

South African Revenue Service

The South African Revenue Service (SARS) engages more with wealthy than with poorer citizens. (The latter all pay value-added tax but this does not involve direct engagement with SARS.) SARS is included here because of the way it has developed electronic means of communication with individual tax-payers and also for its efforts in respect of open data. On the former, the e-filing system has contributed to SARS's efficiency, user-friendliness and increased tax collections. On the latter, for the last few years SARS and National Treasury have produced an annual publication which gives a lot of detail about tax collections and the profile of tax-payers. The reports as well as all tables in this publication are downloadable in Excel format, allowing further analysis. By early 2014 SARS hopes to make anonymised microdata on taxpayers available for further analysis.

South African Social Security Agency

The services of the South African Social Security Agency (SASSA) target the poorest citizens in the country through social grants. In 2013, approximately 11,7 million children benefit from the child support grant, 2,9 million older people receive the old age grant, 1,2 million adults receive the disability grant, more than half a million children benefit from the foster child grant, and smaller numbers receive the remaining grants.

Currently the service providers contracted by SASSA to pay the grants use SMS to inform beneficiaries when the monthly payments are loaded onto their cards or paid into their bank accounts. In the re-registration process conducted over the last year or so, SASSA found that more than 90% of beneficiaries were able to give a cellphone number at which they could be contacted. Even though in many case they may not own the cellphone, this high percentage provides a good basis for using SMS for notification.

SASSA does not currently use Internet or cellphones for other communication with beneficiaries and applicants. Instead, it relies on a well-used free call centre, enquiries and complaints received through the presidential hotline, and complaints boxes in all its offices. The agency is investigating other options, such as installing a kiosk in each office with phones or computers which users can use to report problems (such as being asked for a bribe) or, hopefully, examples of good service. SASSA has also proposed to the Department of Social Development that legislative amendments be made to allow for electronic filing of applicants for grants. SASSA is also an active participant in other monitoring processes such as those of DPME and Black Sash.

SASSA is meanwhile promoting improved ways of using the complaints box system. At some of its offices staff have introduced a weekly public complaints opening event during which the box is opened, and complaints read out and noted on a public noticeboard. The weekly event is also used for reportbacks on how complaints from previous weeks have been

dealt with. This system has resulted in concrete improvements, with specific examples being more regular cleaning of toilets and improved queue management.

Statistics South Africa

Statistics South Africa performs well in terms of making its data available to citizens, generally with no cost to the user. The data includes a host of microdata generated by surveys conducted by the agency, anonymised data on births and death from the Department of Home Affairs, and various forms of interactive applications that allow users to extract tables and graphs.

Google and AMI partnered with Stats SA in 2013, to release granular data from the country's most recent census for the first time, making the data available for 3rd party visualisation and analysis on Google free Public Data Explorer platform. Google assisted with the technical packaging and republication, while AMI facilitated a series of d|Bootcamps (data workshops) and newsroom / NGO engagement initiatives to encourage reuse of the data. The experiment helped shape Stats SA's citizen engagement strategies for digital apps.

These include an iPad app that uses the Roambi data visualisation platform to allow the public to explore census and other research data in a more intuitive way. The app helped Stats SA win a second runner-up award in 2013 in CPSI's category of innovative use of ICTs for effective service delivery. Stats SA is apparently the first statistical agency in the world to disseminate data in this way. The agency plans to develop a similar app for the Android.

Stats SA's Council (its most senior policy making body) has recently embarked on an open data public consultation process, that included presentations and recommendations from the Hacks/Hackers community. AMI is also advising Stats SA on possible pilot citizen engagement intiatives.

The agency is also currently testing a new look to its website which aims to make it more attractive to users with limited technical knowledge of statistics. One aspect of the new approach is to have "data stories" linked to all statistical releases. The agency has also created pages for all municipalities which will bring together in one place all the municipal indicators that the agency collects. In addition, key indicators will be available in all 11 official languages and special pages will be created for children (with the possibility of another page on "women").

Discussion and recommendations

This final section of the report is meant to provide recommendations to the MAVC consortium to guide development of strategy and programmatic options for MAVC programming in South Africa. Before offering any recommendations, the section provides a schematic summary of patterns emerging from the previous sections.

Observations from the mapping

Despite the large number of interviews, emails, documents and web-sites used in the mapping, there are very few initiatives that stand out squarely as strong and successful use of technology in innovative voices to make citizens' voices heard. There are some small initiatives, there are non-technology initiatives that make citizens' voices heard, and there are technology initiatives that involve citizens but are not about making citizens' voices heard. (This statement is not in any way intended to deny the worth and importance of initiatives that do not fit within the MAVC scope.)

There are very few true government champions. Indeed, there were many informants who said that the primary problem was that one needed a government that listened, and that this was generally not in place in South Africa.

Related to the above point, many informants emphasised that technology was neither the problem nor the solution. Technology is a tool that some organisations have used effectively, but it can become problematic if solutions are conceptualised around the tool rather than the tool being used to assist in solving problems.

Many of the identified initiatives relate to complaints-reporting and monitoring in respect of service delivery. This is important, but simple applications for reporting of complaints and monitoring are a form of e-government and should be the responsibility of government. Extending this point, the Black Sash distinguished by describing the work of DPME as government "performance management" while its own monitoring work is "demand accountability".

It is only if reporting and monitoring initiatives have other aspects that go beyond engagement with individual users of services that the applications might fit into e-governance and "making voices count". In this respect, MobiSAM and SJC's approach to Lungisa are interesting in trying to promote a collective aspect.

Rivett's work is important because some of the initiatives described above seem to represent plans to create supply when there is no real demand. This is probably particularly true of open data initiatives.

MobiSAM's finding that some of the documents they sought were, in fact, done simply to comply with regulations and not used by government, alongside Code4SA and ODAC's finding that housing lists do not exist, needs serious consideration for its implications for open data initiatives. One possibility is to use open data initiatives to reveal the fact that these documents are simply unused paper (or files). But there is also a question of how much effort should be spent on showing this.

Many of the identified initiatives do not provide voice beyond very simple responses. These applications can be reported as having engaged tens of thousands of citizens, but if the engagement does not go beyond very short inputs or "voting" through answering a few pre-set questions, then it is more about awareness-raising than about making voices "count". Voices "count" only if there is room for proper debate. In the words of one informant:

"Engagement of government can't be done through technology. It might work for simple issues, but not for more complex."

Both informants and documents emphasised that initiatives related to open data, in particular, were only successful were they took seriously the role of intermediaries, which could take the form of NGOs as well as others. This point is particularly important in South Africa given the poor education system and general inability and unwillingness to engage with numbers and long documents. "Visualisation" is not necessarily the answer and reading visuals requires skills and literacies that should not be assumed for all citizens. McKinley's research into civil society organisations' experiences with open data highlighted a concern that unreflective emphasis on open data might "widen the gap between those organisations and individuals who already possess the human resources and infrastructural means to 'enter' that environment (particularly involving raw [machine-readable] data) and those that do not" (McKinley, 2012: 10-11).

The initiatives found through this mapping exercise were heavily biased towards Cape Town, one of the wealthiest provinces and the one that is least "African" in race terms. The racial bias is also seen in respect of key actors. This again raises a concern about the dangers of elitism that a focus on use of technology for citizen voice might bring unless very carefully designed to have technology as only one element within broader initiatives.

Many informants emphasised the widespread access to cellphones. However, the fact that 89% of households own a cellphone in working order leaves more than a tenth of households without cellphones, and probably a much larger proportion of individuals without access. Further, those who own a working cellphone will often not have the money to cover the costs of making it truly useful.

While social media is widely used, it is not available for those with simple phones or those who cannot afford the charges on smartphones. In Steve Friedman's words:

> Social media … connect the connected, the top one-fifth or less who are already part of the conversation.. New technology may help people communicate better and this may make resistance to dictatorship easier to organise… But technology has not replaced political reality, which makes it essential for people wanting to resist or remove tyrants to organise thoroughly and patiently. We are still a society in which most people have a vote but not a voice and in which the majority are talked about but do not speak. Social media have not ended the problem — they have made it worse by creating the illusion that the connected are the entire nation (Friedman, May 2013).

Many of the initiatives target youth, and youth are often characterised as a group that is especially reachable through cellphones and comfortable with technology. However, some of the youth-directed initiatives seem to target youth as individuals. While this may be of benefit to individual youth, it is not about making citizens' voices heard if we understand the term "citizen" to mean more than atomised individuals with individual rights and needs. Further,

over-strong emphasis on youth also raises the question as to whether older adults – those who were most disadvantaged by apartheid – are to be neglected.

The mapping unearthed many citizen journalist initiatives, and there are no doubt many more that were not uncovered. These seem to be initiatives that generate real interest and enthusiasm from youth. They are, however, not generally about making citizens' voices heard by government. They are, perhaps, about making citizens' voices heard by other citizens, including some who might have more influence than those producing the stories.

Some of the support for technology initiatives takes the form of competitions and challenges. This mirrors the emphasis on "innovation". The danger is that this encourages competition and short-termism at the expense of ongoing support for collaborative organisation and work. This danger is particularly worrying in the context of the severe funding shortage for civil society organisations in South Africa (as well as in other countries).

Linked to the above is the danger that NGOs will develop technology-linked projects because that is where funding is available. The danger with such donor-driven "fashions" is what happens when the fashion passes – a danger that South African civil society experienced in the 1990s when substantial European Union funding for advice offices came to an end, and more recently when PEPFAR funding for service delivery in respect of HIV and AIDS is being substantially scaled down.

South Africa has eleven languages, and poorer people are also those who are least likely to be able to read and write English with ease. Yet English remains the dominant language in many initiatives. Language issues are not adequately considered in many applications.

Recommendations

As noted at the outset, the timing of the mapping exercise coincided with the global call for proposals for MAVC. Approximately fifty proposals were submitted from South Africa, and the MAVC partners will no doubt select some from among these for funding support. It is likely that at least some of those supported are among those described in this report.

This report does not therefore identify individual projects for support. Instead, it suggests that MAVC consider funding a group of organisations in developing and implementing a broader project that will support and build on existing organisations in civil society. MAVC should avoid the creation of new organisations but instead support those that already exist and have proved their worth. In particular, R2K presents itself as a promising core organisation (or movement) for support. It does so because:
   - R2K is a movement that brings together large numbers of organisations and individuals across all nine provinces of the country;
   - R2K has proved that it can bring together and work with a very diverse set of organisations and actors, allowing each of the actors to contribute in the way that they are able and willing to do;

- R2K has proved that it is not afraid to tackle key questions (such as the Secrecy Bill) and has done so in a way that has won widespread support from a wide political spectrum of people;
- R2K has proved that it is creative and can capture the imagination of large numbers of people and organisations and "make their voice heard";
- R2K has already used technology impressively as a tool in its campaigns and understands both its possibilities and limitations;
- While R2K acknowledges that its use of technology directly reaches the middle class, many of those whom it reaches have close links and can and do act as intermediaries for the "unconnected"'
- R2K has conceptualised a project (described briefly above) that will bring together open data/information access, advocacy, and research and education around service delivery, using all its constituent parts for the roles in which they have most expertise and, in doing so, having the potential to be more than the sum of its parts. This project has been approved by its democratically elected governing body as a campaign. It could serve as a core focus of MAVC's programming in South Africa.

Sources of information

Interviews

Fola Adeleke, South African Human Rights Commission – 6 November 2013
Justin Arenstein – 21 November 2013
Shireen Badat, Upstart – 13 February 2013
Marcha Bekker & Matthew de Gale, Praekelt Foundation – 20 November 2013
Marjan Besuijen, HIVOS – 4 November 2013
Peter Benjamin, mhealth – 5 November 2013
Nicole Boot, VNG South Africa – 5 November 2013
Shaamela Cassiem, International Budget Parnership – 31 October 2013
Jane Coombe and Lynette Maart – 5 November 2013
Dominic Cull, connected to Internet Service Providers Association – 4 November 2013
Kerry Cullinan, health-e – 14 November 2013
Roderick Davids, National Anti-Corruption Forum – 4 November 2013
Dianne Dunkerley, SASSA – 19 November 2013
Anriette Esterhuysen, APC - 21 November 2013
Adi Eyal, Code4SA – 13 November 2013
Gaile Fullard, Parliamentary Monitoring Group – 14 November 2013
Liz Gavin, South African Revenue Service – 31 October 2013
Ruendree Govender – 19 November 2013
Manti Grobler, SAP – 15 November 2013
Ellen Hagerman, Social Development Direct – 7 November 2013
Debbie Heustice, Info for Africa – 7 November 2013
Glenn Hollands – 18 November 2013
Martin Jansen, Cape TV – 8 November 2013
Ahmed Kajee, 6 November 2013

Greg Kempe – 19 November 2013
Derrick Kotze, mLab – 26 November 2013
Alan Levin, Internet Society of South Africa – 27 November 2013
Bongi Mlangeni, Corruption Watch – 4 November 2013
Phumeza Mlungwana, Social Justice Coalition – 7 November 2013
Victoria Nembaware and Abongile Nyumeka, Cell-Life – 8 November 2013
Ory Okolloh, Omidyar Foundation – 13 November 2013
Marlon Parker, RLabs – 21 November 2013
Andre Proctor, Keystone – 7 November 2013
Jenny Radloff, APCWomen – 8 November 2013
Shaun Russell, Ndifuna Ukwazi – 20 November 2013
Gillian Schutte, Media for Justice – 5 November 2013
Anne Schwartz, GIZ/SALGA – 13 November 2013
Hannah Thinyane, Rhodes University – 11 November 2013
Alison Tilley, Open Democracy Advice Centre of South Africa – 13 November 2013
Jonathan Timm, 19 November 2013
Loren Treisman, Indigo Foundation – 15 November 2013
Penelope Vellem, Afesis-Corplan, 4 November 2013
Elme Vivier, HSRC, 6 November 2013
Mark Weinberg, Right2Know – 8 November 2013
Tara Weinberg, Rural Women Action Research Unit – 7 November 2013
Lynn Woolfrey, DataFirst – 13 November 2013

Other information providers

People who provided information through email included Nasima Badsha, Keren Ben-Zeev, Kathleen Diga, Narnia Bohler-Muller, Patrick Bond, Viv Bozalek, Douglas Cohen, Willie Currie, Brett Davidson, Alan Finlay, Steven Friedman, Vee Govender, Steven Gruzd, Ellen Hagerman, Murray Hunter, Doron Isaacs, Peter Jacobs, Anne Jellema, Kevin Johnston, Ahmed Kajee, Luxolo Lengs, Paul Maassen, Ralph Mathekga, Norman Mampane, Shepi Mati, Robert Mattes, Sheila Meintjes, Yandiswa Mpetsheni, Diane Sanchez, Alette Schoon, Anne Schwarz, Marion Stevens, Amy Taylor, Mirjam van Donk, Sandisiwe Vilakazi, Kathy Watters, Sharman Wickham

Documentary references

Benjamin, Peter. 2012. New media perspectives: Social media & mobile in future citizen participation. Presentation to People's Parliament, August 2012. Cell-Life: Cape Town.

Bohler-Muller, Narnia. October 2013. Enhancing Digital Citizen Engagement: Some lessons from South Africa. Draft presentation. World Social Science Forum, Montreal.

CPSI Awards. Mail & Guardian advertising supplement, 8-14 November, 2013

Department of Performance Management and Evaluation. 11 June 2013. A framework for strengthening citizen-government partnerships for monitoring frontline service delivery. Presidency: Pretoria.

DG Murray Trust. 2013. Reducing the user data costs of mobile applications and value-added services for national development: What can be done in the short- to medium term? Report of a consultative meeting of select industry & Government role-players held at Barloworld on 10 May 2013

Friedman, Steven. 29 May 2013. Social media a far cry from the 'voice of the people', Business Day.

Goldstuck, Arthur. 2012. Internet Matters: The Quiet Engine of the South African Economy. World Wide Worx for Google South Africa: Johannesburg

Hollands, Glenn. 2013. The innovative use of social media to advance citizens' participation in government. Mbumba Development Services.

Kajee, Ahmed. May 2013. Reducing the Costs of Mobile Communications in South Africa: An Ecosystem Discussion.

Keystone. Autumn 2013. Constituent Voice. Technical Note 1.

McKinley, Dale T. December 2012. The Right to Know, the Right to Live: Open data in South Africa. Prepared for the Open Democracy Advice Centre: Cape Town.

Mathekga, Ralph. 2013. South Africa Progress Report 2011-2013. Independent Reporting Mechanism. Open Government Partnership: Washington DC.

MobiSAM is here to help. Grocott's Mail, http://www.grocotts.co.za/content/must-online-mobisam-here-help-05-09-2013.

Mudavanhu Selina and Radloff Jennifer.2013. Taking feminist activism online: reflections on the 'Keep Saartjie Baartman Centre Open' e-campaign. Gender & Development 21(1): 327-341.

National Development Plan. Addendum A. A conversation with South Africans.

Right2Know. January 2013. The Right2 Communicate. Right2Know Activists' Guide. Right2Know: Cape Town.

Right2Know. Undated. Draft Concept Note on Access to Information Project: 'Open democracy – open data'

SALGA. 2013. Guideline Outlining the Legal & Regulatory Framework Governing Mobile Communication (SMS) and Social Media and its implications when used by Local Government. Prepared by Ellipsis Regulatory Solutions and WebTechLaw.

Song, Steve. October 2010. Open Spectrum for Development: South Africa Case Study. Prepared for Association of Progressive Communicators: Johannesburg. Shuttleworth Foundation.

South African Local Government Association and GIZ. 2012. Study into the Potential to Utilize Information and Communication Technologies (ICT's) to Promote Inclusion, Public Participation and Accountability in Local Governance. Prepared by Project for Conflict Resolution and Development in partnership with Mbumba Development Services and eKhaya ICT.

Tagney, Caroline. Forthcoming. "Women, secrecy, freedom of expression and access to information" in GISWatch.

The Presidency. October 2013. CBM Questions and Answers: Piloting citizen-government service delivery monitoring partnerships

Thinyane Hannah and Coulson Debbie. MobiSAM: Mobile Social Accountability Monitoring in South Africa.

Thinyane, Hannah. 2013. Stumbling at the start line: an analysis of factors affecting participation with local government in South Africa. Prepared for ICT for Global Development conference, Milan, Italy.

Ulrike Rivett, Taylor, Derek, van Belle, Jean-Paul, Chigona, Wallace, Maphazi, Nondumiso and Forlee, Bianca. 2013. An Assessment of Incentivising Community Engagement in Drinking Water Supply Management: Research Method Report. For Water Research Commission. University of Cape Town: Cape Town and Nelson Mandela Metropolian University: Port Elizabeth

VNG International. 2013. Good Practice Case Studies.

Vushe E, James T, Esterhuysen A & Magome K. 2011? Taking Stock: An assessment of current initiatives in libraries and public ICT access points in South Africa. Association for Progressive Communications: Johannesburg.